Overview

Background and History

Increased public concern over the adverse effects of pesticide residues in food and the environment has led to the partial replacement of fumigation by alternative control methods. Among these methods, the only one that retains the special capacity of fumigation for in-situ treatment of stored commodities, as well as offering a similar diversity of application technologies, is the modified atmosphere (MA) method. Modified or controlled atmospheres offer a safe and environmentally benign alternative to the use of conventional residue-producing chemical fumigants for controlling insect pests that attack stored grain, oilseeds, processed commodities, and packaged foods.

Hermetic storage of grain was practiced in ancient times in underground pits in the dry, subtropical regions of the Middle East and other dry regions of the world, such as Africa and India. Underground pits for grain storage were still used in Egypt in the 1940s, as described by Attia (1948). Very old but active hermetic storage reports were to be in operation in India (Girish, 1980) and in Yemen, Somalia, Sudan, and Egypt (Kamel, 1980). It has been suggested that, in Biblical times, Joseph employed hermetic storage for the preservation of the large grain reserves in Egypt during the seven years of plenty (Calderon, 1990).

The pioneers in the use of MAs in modern times considered the method to be an adaptation of the old principle of hermetic storage (Attia, 1948; Hyde and Daubney, 1960). One of the enthusiastic promoters of the hermetic-storage principle was the renowned French entomologist P. Vayssiere (1948). In his article in the first publication by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations on grain storage, he called hermetic storage “the process of the future for protection of foodstuffs.” The scientific and practical aspects of the MA method for food preservation were reviewed intensively in the 1950s by Oxley (1948), Bailey (1955), and Hyde et al (1973). Later, Sigaut (1980) stated that, in preindustrial times, hermetic storage was probably one of the means of keeping large quantities of grain free from insect attack for significant lengths of time in areas with mild winters. He also reported that the first large-scale tests were run in underground pits in Paris from 1819 to 1830. This principle was also used on a large scale in Argentina during and after World War II, when facilities were constructed and used for the underground hermetic storage of over 2.5 million tonnes of grain (Lopez, 1946; Anonymous, 1949). More-modern concrete hermetic-storage bins built primarily for famine protection have been constructed in Cyprus and Kenya for corn storage and are continuously in operation (De Lima, 1980).

Studies in the 1860s on modifying atmospheres by adding N₂ or “burned air” to grain storages were also reported by Sigaut (1980). However, serious interest in using the technique in a practical, routine manner was not pursued until the 1950s and 1960s, probably due to the success of conventional fumigants and grain protectants in controlling stored-product pests. During this period, people began to realize that the chemicals, if used improperly, left objectionably residues, that they were hazardous to apply, and that there was a potential for the development of insect resistance to them. Research on the use of MAs was initiated during this time in Australia and in the United States and is ongoing in these and several other countries. This research has significantly restricted the use of chemicals in food. An important development stimulating further work on MA took place in the United States in 1980 and 1981. The Environmental Protection Agency approved an exemption from tolerance for CO₂, N₂, and products from an “inert” gas generator when used to control insects in raw (Federal Register, 1980) and processed (Federal Register, 1981) agricultural products.

MA and controlled atmosphere (CA) treatments for the disinfection of dry stored products have received increasing scientific attention during the last 25 years. Although this method has become well established for control of storage pests, its commercial use is still limited to a few countries (Navarro et al, 1979; Shejbal, 1980b; Banks and Ripp, 1984; Jay and d’Orazio, 1984; Fleurat Lessard and Le Torc’h, 1987; Adler et al, 2000). Reviews on stored-product protection with MAs can be found in the publications of Bailey and Banks (1975, 1980); Jay (1980, 1984a,b), Banks (1981, 1983a,b), Annis (1987), Calderon and Barkai-Golan (1990), and Adler et al (2000).

The widespread scientific activities on this subject resulted in several international conferences, such as the International Conference on Controlled Atmospheres and Fumigation, which was held in 1980 in Rome, Italy (Shejbal, 1980a); in 1983 in Perth, Australia (Ripp et al, 1984); in 1989 in Singapore (Champ et al, 1990); in 1992...
in Winnipeg, Canada (Navarro and Donahaye, 1993b); in 1996 in Nicosia, Cyprus (Donahaye et al., 1997); and in 2000 in the United States in Fresno, CA (Donahaye et al., 2001). New research findings on CAS were also reported at the International Working Conferences on Stored-Product Protection held in the United States in Savannah, GA, in 1974 (Anonymous, 1975); in Ibadan, Nigeria, in 1978 (Davis and Taylor, 1979); in Manhattan, KS, United States, in 1983 (Anonymous, 1984); in Tel Aviv, Israel, in 1986 (Donahaye and Navarro, 1987); in Bordeaux, France, in 1990 (Fleurat-Lessard and Ducom, 1991); in Canberra, Australia, in 1994 (Highley et al., 1994); in Beijing, China, in 1998 (Zuxun et al., 1999); and in York, United Kingdom, in 2002 (Credland et al., 2003). The annual research conferences on methyl bromide alternatives in the United States also provide a forum to enhance technology transfer (MBAO, 2003). These meetings served for the fruitful exchange of information among the participating scientists and the reciprocal insemination of new ideas for further research. The continuing interest in MAs led to the updating of this chapter, based on the text written by my friend, the late Ed Jay (Jay, 1984a). I wish to dedicate this chapter to his memory.

Definitions and Uses of MA

The objective of MA treatment is to attain a composition of atmospheric gases rich in CO₂ and low in O₂, or a combination of these two gases at normal or altered atmospheric pressure within the treatment enclosure, for the exposure time necessary to control the storage pests. Various terms used in reference to MA storage for the control of storage insect pests or the preservation of food have appeared in the literature to define the same method of treatment but using different means to attain the same scope of control without adversely affecting the environment. Therefore, in this section, definitions are proposed, to add clarity to the available storage-insect control methods, whether at normal atmospheric pressure or under altered atmospheric pressure.

Modified atmosphere (MA) is proposed as the general term, including all cases in which the composition of atmospheric gases or their partial pressures in the treatment enclosure have been modified to create conditions favorable for the control of storage insects. In an MA treatment, the atmospheric composition within the treated enclosure may change during the treatment period. This term comprises all the following designations.

MAs Under Normal Atmospheric Pressure

Controlled atmosphere (CA). In a CA treatment, the atmospheric composition in the treated enclosure is controlled or maintained at a level lethal to insects. The modified gas composition, usually produced artificially, is maintained unchanged by additionally generating the desired gases (CO₂ or N₂) or by further purging the storage with these gases, supplied from pressurized cylinders or otherwise (Fig. 1). These supplemental gases are introduced when their concentration in the sealed container drops to below the desired level. The CA method is intended to compensate for possible small leakages of gases, which cause the increase of the O₂ or decrease of the CO₂ content in the enclosure and which are almost impossible to avoid. Thus, the term “CA,” although commonly used as the one describing the entire subject, actually has its own specific meaning.

Hermetic storage. A type of MA that can be applied for the protection of grain is “hermetic storage,” termed also “sealed storage,” “airtight storage,” or “sacrificial sealed storage.” This method takes advantage of the gases produced naturally by the respiratory metabolism of insects and commodities, using them to prevent insect development. Sufficiently sealed structures enable insects and other aerobic organisms in the commodity, or the commodity itself, to generate the MA by reducing the O₂ and increasing the CO₂ concentrations. The exposure time needed to control the insect populations and to protect the grain using hermetic storage depends on the infestation level and the activity of other aerobic organisms.

Assisted hermetic storage. Another type of hermetic storage uses exothermic gas generators, catalytic oxygen converters, or respiration gases of plant material. In this type of hermetic storage, the atmosphere is modified by the supply of gases generated outside the storage container, so that a gas composition of low oxygen (<1%) and high carbon dioxide can be achieved artificially. Exothermic gas generators burn fossil fuels to generate the low-O₂ atmosphere. Catalytic oxygen converters burn propane or butane by catalytic conversion processes without flame. Oxygen could also be removed from the air by respiration, using various plant materials or wastes placed in an external generator.

MAs Under Altered Atmospheric Pressure

Vacuum. In a low-pressure environment there is a close correlation between the partial pressure of the remaining O₂ and the rate of kill. Until recently, this treatment could be carried out only in specially constructed rigid and expensive vacuum chambers. A proposed alternative practical solution consists of the vacuum hermetic fumigation process using flexible liners. To achieve the low pressures in the flexible liners, sufficiently low pressures (25–50 mm of Hg absolute pressure) are obtained (using a commercial vacuum pump) and maintained for indefinite periods of time (Navarro et al., 2001c).

Fig. 1. Application of carbon-dioxide-based modified atmosphere in a large silo bin in Kingston, NC, U.S.A.
High-pressure carbon dioxide treatment. CO₂ treatments can be significantly shortened to exposure times measured in hours using increased pressure (10–37 bar) applied in specially designed metal chambers that can withstand the high pressures. Because of the high initial capital investment, these high-pressure-chamber treatments may be practical for high-value products such as spices, nuts, medicinal herbs, and other special commodities.

Modifying the Atmosphere of the Storage Ecosystem

Storage as an Ecosystem

Our ability to successfully apply MA in stored durable agricultural products depends on many interrelated factors (Fig. 2). To better understand their interplay, and the potential areas of intervention for improving traditional storage, the storage structure is considered an ecosystem (Sinha and Muir, 1973; Calderon, 1981). (In this section, for the sake of convenience, cereal grains and pulses serve as the example for the stored commodities.) The interrelated factors are common to all storage situations, whether they are grain in high-tech silos or grain home-stored in jute sacks. A convenient way to analyze the interactive relationships between these storage-environment factors is to consider a storage structure as the boundary that defines the environment of a community of interacting living organisms, which can be termed an “ecological system” or ecosystem (Sinha and Muir, 1973; Calderon, 1981).

Components of the Ecosystem

The stored grain. This is the component of principal interest to us and the one we wish to protect from insect damage. Grain in itself is a biotic factor of the system, a living organism in a state of dormancy that can remain unchanged for prolonged periods.

The storage structure. This component, which forms the boundaries of the ecosystem, is predetermined and fixed. The materials and nature of its composition and its placement are important in determining the extent to which external factors (both biotic and abiotic) affect the system. The structure must be mechanically designed to hold the grain and maintain the MA without gas loss.

Temperature. Ambient temperature is an abiotic factor that has little direct influence on grain condition but greatly influences some biotic components (insects and microflora) and therefore indirectly affects conservation of grain quality.

Humidity. Ambient humidity is an abiotic factor of the air surrounding the grains. Within the confined storage space, the moisture of the grains is important because the humidity will reach equilibrium with this moisture. The greatest influence of humidity is on molds, which begin to develop at intergranular humidities above 70%.

Atmospheric composition. Atmospheric gases that constitute air make up the third abiotic factor. The atmosphere composes about 50% of the volume of the storage structure; it fills the spaces between the grain kernels and the headspace above the grain. When there is free movement between the air inside and outside the storage structure, the composition of the atmosphere is relatively constant, consisting of about 78% nitrogen, 20.9% oxygen, 0.03% carbon dioxide, and other inert gases like argon. However, if free movement of air between the grain bulk and the outside atmosphere is restricted or completely prevented, then the biotic factors (the grain, insects, and microorganisms) may strongly alter the atmospheric composition of the ecosystem, reducing the oxygen concentration and increasing the carbon dioxide concentration.

Insects. Stored-product insects consist of a group of some 250 species (beetles and moths) characterized by their small size (which enables them to penetrate the interstices of the grain bulk), their worldwide distribution, and their feeding habits in dry environments. About six species are the major pests, and several of them attack crops in the field, thereby entering the ecosystem at the moment of loading the grain into storage. Their rates of development and population increase are strongly influenced by the temperature of the grain bulk, and their metabolic activity consumes oxygen and produces carbon dioxide, heat, and moisture, which in turn affect all biotic components of the ecosystem. Their development is suppressed and even controlled when the intergranular atmosphere is rich in carbon dioxide and deficient in oxygen.

Microorganisms. This biotic factor is composed of molds, yeasts, and bacteria. They are universally present on the grain but are inactive at humidities favorable to storage, which are those below 65% equilibrium relative humidity. When the moisture of the grain in equilibrium with 65% RH rises above a critical level, molds begin to develop.

Since both molds and insects release heat and moisture by their metabolism, they may produce temperature and moisture gradients within the stored-grain ecosystem. This, in turn, can create convection currents through the grain bulk, carrying warm, moist air from the heating region to cooler regions, where the moisture is deposited as the air

---

**Fig. 2.** External factors and the interrelated ecosystem components of grain in sealed bulks. (Compiled from Navarro and Noyes, 2002)
cools. Such areas of condensation favor the development of microorganisms and may even cause the grain to germinate. As with insects, mold development is suppressed when the storage atmosphere is strongly modified, although this process cannot control anaerobic microorganisms.

**Foreign matter.** Chaff, stalks, grain dust, sand, earth, stones, dockage, etc. can either be abiotic components of the ecosystem or originate as dead parts of plants. The effects of foreign matter on the ecosystem are many. Chaff and grain dust tend to absorb moisture more rapidly than grain and present a more suitable substrate for mold development than whole grains. Many insects that are unable to penetrate sound grain are able to develop well on this material. All small particles of material tend to block the interstitial air spaces and therefore may prevent the application of control measures that rely on the penetration of MAs throughout the grain bulk to kill insect populations.

**EFFECTS OF MA ON STORED-PRODUCT INSECTS AND MITES**

Storage insects are aerobic organisms requiring oxygen for their survival. Therefore, they respond to altered atmospheric gas compositions containing low O₂ or high CO₂.

**Low Oxygen and Anoxia**

In addition to nitrogen, which is commonly used to produce a low-oxygen atmosphere, rare gases like helium and argon have also been tested (Lindgren and Vincent, 1970; Ali Niazee, 1972) to demonstrate that they cause anoxia, with effects similar to those of nitrogen. Nitrogen is active in producing a progressive hypoxia or anoxia only when used alone at a high purity level. Generally, the lower the oxygen level, the higher the mortality. For effective control, the O₂ level should be <3% and preferably <1% if a rapid kill is required (Navarro, 1978; Banks and Annis, 1990; Fleurat Lessard, 1990). This effect is reversed below 1% oxygen in nitrogen, where the adult rice weevils, *Sitophilus oryzae* (Navarro, 1978) showed significant differences in adult mortality between 0.1 and 1.0% O₂ (Navarro, 1978). Similar experiments with *T. confusum* in nitrogen (Jay and Pearman, 1971; Shejbal et al, 1973; Tunc and Navarro, 1983) showed a critical oxygen level at 0.9%, and >1.4% O₂ was found to be ineffective. The adults are generally the most susceptible to the treatment, and *S. oryzae* or *Rhizopertha dominica* (the lesser grain borer) was demonstrated to be more tolerant than *Tribolium* spp. The lowest level of tolerance to lack of oxygen was attained around the 1% concentration level (Fig. 3).

Adults of the grain mite, *Acarus siro*, were exposed to various O₂ atmospheres in nitrogen. The exposure times to obtain complete mortality at 2% O₂ were 48 and 72 hr at temperatures of 26 and 15°C, respectively (Navarro et al, 1985b).

**High Carbon Dioxide and Hypercarbia**

Atmospheres containing about 60% carbon dioxide rapidly kill stored-product insects. At 26°C, about four days of exposure would be sufficient to kill all stages (including eggs) of most stored-product insects. When the concentration level of CO₂ was reduced to about 35% for only 10 days of exposure time, less than 1% of *T. confusum* adults were killed.

**Lethal Action of MA on Insects**

**Fig. 3. Relationship between oxygen concentration and the time required for 95% mortality (A), and the effect on daily percent loss in weight (B) of three stored-product insects at 54% RH and 26°C. (Redrawn, and used with permission, from Navarro, 1978)**
larvae survived the treatment (Ronai and Jay, 1982). This concentration seems to be the target level, above which toxicity of carbon dioxide occurs (Jay et al., 1970; Jay and Pearman, 1973). Laboratory tests on the major stored-product insects have shown that adults can be killed with pure CO₂ within 10–48 hr; exposure times of more than 14 days are required to kill them when the atmosphere contains less than 40% CO₂ even at temperature levels above 20°C (Kashi, 1981). The initial symptoms of carbon dioxide poisoning in insects include a narcotic effect, leading to knock-down, i.e., immobilization of the insects under carbon-dioxide-enriched atmospheres (Edwards, 1953; Ali Niazee, 1971, 1972; Edwards and Batten, 1973).

The dosage-response data for S. oryzae, T. castaneum, and Euphestia cautella (the almond moth) given in Table 1 illustrate the range of susceptibility within a species. There are more laboratory data for S. oryzae than for any other stored-product pest and, except for Trogoderma spp., it appears to be the most tolerant of high-CO₂ atmospheres. The minimum concentration required to give a high and rapid mortality for all developmental stages is slightly less than 40%. Eggs are significantly affected by 20% CO₂, while at >20%, adult insects are the most susceptible stage (Banks and Annis, 1990).

Diapausing Trogoderma granarium (Khapra beetle) larvae are the most tolerant to high-CO₂ atmospheres of any species and stage so far reported (Annis, 1987). They are tolerant of CO₂ concentrations of 60% or less in air at 25°C, and less than 95% mortality has been obtained after 25 days, the longest exposure so far tested. It appears that diapausing Trogoderma variabile (the warehouse beetle) larvae may have a similar response (Banks and Annis, 1990). Other Trogoderma spp. are also very tolerant (Jay, 1984b).

### Combinations of Low Oxygen and High Carbon Dioxide

Researchers have been interested in increasing the efficacy of MA by attempting to combine very low oxygen and very high carbon dioxide concentrations. However, increasing the carbon dioxide concentration in a normal atmosphere proportionally reduces the partial pressure of the oxygen available to insects. For example, attempting to achieve a 40% CO₂ concentration at normal atmospheric pressure proportionally reduces the oxygen to about 12.6%; by the same comparison, increasing the CO₂ to 90% reduces the available oxygen to 2.1%. Gas burners or fossil burners also have the capability of generating a combination of low oxygen and high carbon dioxide. For example, a typical propane burner would produce an atmosphere of 0.5% oxygen, 13.5% CO₂, 1% nitrogen, and 1% argon. Therefore, unless a mixture of nitrogen and carbon dioxide or a gas-burner atmosphere is used, the simplest way to achieve a low-oxygen and high-CO₂ atmosphere is by using CO₂ (Storey, 1975b).

Some systematic investigations on the effect of low-O₂ atmospheres (<4% O₂ containing various proportions of CO₂, but typically with 10–20% CO₂), also known as “burner gas,” were carried out. In laboratory experiments, larval, pupal, and adult stages of the nitidulid beetles Carpophilus hemipterus and Urophorus humeralis were exposed to simulated burner-gas concentrations at three temperature and gas combinations. These were 1% O₂, 85% N₂, and 14% CO₂ at 26°C; 2% O₂, 84.7% N₂, and 13.3% CO₂ at 30°C; and 3% O₂, 85% N₂, and 12% CO₂ at 35°C—all at 75% RH. For all insects submitted to the MA containing 3% O₂ at 26°C, the exposure time to produce 95% mortality was 196 hr. To obtain the same mortality level with the MA containing 1% O₂ at 35°C, 60 hr was required (Donahaye et al., 1994). Some species, e.g., T. castaneum as adults, were shown to be more susceptible to low-oxygen atmospheres containing CO₂ than to those containing pure N₂. The response of others, notably Sitophilus spp., appeared little affected by the presence of 10–20% CO₂ (Bailey and Banks, 1980). The researchers concluded that there may be some advantage in practice in using a proportion of CO₂ in low-O₂ atmospheres, although the reduction in exposure time will not be substantial if Sitophilus spp. are present. Calderon and Navarro (1979, 1980) and Krishnamurthy et al. (1986) have claimed significant reduction in exposure times in the presence of >10% CO₂. In the case of hypoxia (2–5% O₂), when a small proportion of CO₂

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Oxygen (%)</th>
<th>Carbon Dioxide (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephestia cautella</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sitophilus oryzae</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>&lt;5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>...</td>
<td>&lt;5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>&gt;14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribolium castaneum</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>&gt;3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Data from Annis (1987), Banks and Annis (1990), Navarro et al. (1985c), and Tunc and Navarro (1983).

b E = eggs; L = larvae; P = pupae; A = adults.
(5–40%) is added to the initial mixture of N₂/O₂, the mortality rate increases considerably (Calderon and Navarro, 1979) (Fig. 4). When CO₂ is added to low-O₂ atmospheres, a synergistic effect is obvious from the significant interaction between the concentrations of these two gases (Calderon and Navarro, 1980). Even with the tolerant species, Trogoderma granarium, at the larval stage in 1.1–1.2% O₂, the exposure time necessary to kill 50% of the insect population (i.e., lethal time, LT₅₀) was decreased from 39 to 27 hr, when CO₂ concentrations were increased from 0 to 15% (Girish, 1978). This effect seems fairly similar to the enhancement of efficiency of fumigants by low concentrations (10–20%) of CO₂ reported by other workers (Bond and Buckland, 1978; Calderon and Leesch, 1983).

Jay (1984a) stated that, for Sitophilus spp., pure CO₂ is not as effective as a 60% CO₂ atmosphere (8% residual O₂). The complete lack of oxygen was found antagonistic to the toxic effect of CO₂. In a different experimental procedure, it was observed that atmospheres containing as much as 15% O₂ were lethal to T. castaneum and Plodia interpunctella larvae when about 36% CO₂ was added (Harein and Press, 1968).

Valid laboratory studies can provide guidance in selecting MA concentrations, exposure times, and optimum temperature ranges, which can be used in conducting field experiments. An example of this can be seen in Table 2, which shows the effects on mortality (based on adult emergence) of seven different MAs on one- to five-week-old immature maize weevils, Sitophilus zeamais, at the same temperature and relative humidity during one- to four-day exposures. Increasing the N₂ concentration from 97 to 100% greatly reduced emergence, as did increasing the CO₂ concentration from 39 to 62%. Increasing the CO₂ concentration to 99% produced less mortality than was obtained at about 60%. Such laboratory studies show that, for this species, CO₂ is more biocidal than N₂; that there is no need to increase the CO₂ concentration above 60%; and that a longer exposure is needed to obtain complete control.

Interrelated Physical Environment Effects

Effect of Air Relative Humidity and MA

Laboratory studies have shown that lowering the RH increases the effectiveness of MAs. Jay et al (1971), working with adults of T. confusum, T. castaneum, and Oryzaephilus surinamensis (the sawtoothed grain beetle), found that, in atmospheres containing 99% N₂ (balance O₂), decreasing the RH from 68 to 9% increased the mortality from 3 to 98.5% in a 24-hr exposure of the red flour beetle. The two other insects showed a similar response to reduced relative humidity (Table 3). These three species also exhibited a similar response to mixtures of CO₂ in air at lowered relative humidities.

Desiccation plays a large role in the mortality of stored-product insects exposed to some MAs. Jay and Cuff (1981) showed that when larvae, pupa, and adults of the red flour beetle were exposed to various concentrations of CO₂, the mortality increased with decreasing RH. This effect was more pronounced at lower temperatures. The results indicated that the critical RH for mortality of these insects was 50–60% at 26°C and 40–50% at 30°C. The RH at which 50% mortality occurred (RH₅₀) varied with the concentration of CO₂ in the atmosphere. For example, at 26°C, the RH₅₀ was 60% when the atmosphere contained 39% CO₂, but it decreased to 40% when the atmosphere contained 99% CO₂.

Interrelated Physical Environment Effects

Effect of Air Relative Humidity and MA

Laboratory studies have shown that lowering the RH increases the effectiveness of MAs. Jay et al (1971), working with adults of T. confusum, T. castaneum, and Oryzaephilus surinamensis (the sawtoothed grain beetle), found that, in atmospheres containing 99% N₂ (balance O₂), decreasing the RH from 68 to 9% increased the mortality from 3 to 98.5% in a 24-hr exposure of the red flour beetle. The two other insects showed a similar response to reduced relative humidity (Table 3). These three species also exhibited a similar response to mixtures of CO₂ in air at lowered relative humidities.

Desiccation plays a large role in the mortality of stored-product insects exposed to some MAs. Jay and Cuff (1981) showed that when larvae, pupa, and adults of the red flour beetle were exposed to various concentrations of CO₂, the mortality increased with decreasing RH. This effect was more pronounced at lower temperatures. The results indicated that the critical RH for mortality of these insects was 50–60% at 26°C and 40–50% at 30°C. The RH at which 50% mortality occurred (RH₅₀) varied with the concentration of CO₂ in the atmosphere. For example, at 26°C, the RH₅₀ was 60% when the atmosphere contained 39% CO₂, but it decreased to 40% when the atmosphere contained 99% CO₂.
beetle were exposed to varying concentrations of CO₂ or O₂, weight loss was much higher in some of the atmospheres than in others or in air. Navarro and Calderon (1974) showed a linear relationship of the combined effect of CO₂ and RH in producing a lethal environment for E. cautella pupae (Fig. 5). Navarro and Calderon (1980) demonstrated the strong effect of low concentrations of CO₂ and O₂ on causing mortality in E. cautella pupae (Fig. 6). Other laboratory studies have shown that the susceptibility of different species or strains of the same species varies considerably when insects are exposed to the same concentrations of MAs (Jay and Pearman, 1971).

**Effect of Temperature and MA**

At temperatures of 20–30°C, most species and developmental stages show >95% mortality in <10 days at both 0 and 1.0% O₂ (Annis, 1987). *Trogoderma granarium* larvae (12 days at 0% O₂), *S. oryzae* pupae (20 days at 0% O₂; >14 days at 1% O₂), and *Sitophilus granarius* (granary weevil) adults (16 days at 1% O₂) are the only exceptions so far found (Annis, 1987).

The influence of temperature on the length of time necessary to obtain good control with MAs is as important as with conventional fumigants. Jay (1971) stated that, to obtain good control, “the temperature of the grain should be above 21°C during the application of CO₂.” Navarro and Calderon (1980) compared the effect of temperature on the exposure time required to produce the mortality of adults of three storage insects in MAs (Fig. 7).

Jay (1984c) showed that, at 15.4°C, complete control of immature *R. dominica* was obtained after four weeks of exposure to 60% CO₂. Donahaye et al (1994) reported on responses of larval, pupal, and adult stages of the nitidulid beetles *C. hemipterus* and *U. humeralis* exposed to simulated burner-gas concentrations at three temperatures of 26, 30, and 35°C. Comparison of exposure times showed that the effect of temperature on treatment efficacy was most pronounced at the 1% O₂ level, where, for the three stages of both species tested, values of LT₅₀ at 26°C were about half those at 35°C. However, at 3% O₂ and 35°C, LT₅₀ levels were only marginally reduced (Donahaye et al, 1994).
Soderstrom et al. (1992) examined the influence of temperature over the range of 38–42°C on the effects of hypoxia and hypercarbia on T. castaneum adults for 60-hr exposures. Although the different experimental conditions make comparison difficult, their results clearly indicate that raised temperatures could be used to reduce treatment duration. Donahaye et al. (1996) exposed eggs, larvae, pupae, and adults of T. castaneum to three low-oxygen concentrations at 26, 30, and 35°C. At all levels of O2 (1, 2, and 3%), in typical respiration atmospheres under hermetic conditions (similar to burner-gas atmospheres), the LT99 values at 35°C were significantly lower than those at 26°C. Work on all four development stages of E. cautella showed the strong influence of temperature on mortality values when the insects were exposed to CO2 concentrations varying from 60 to 90% in air (Navarro et al., 2002b; 2003b) (Table 4).

**Effects of Low Pressures**

The mortality of insects under low pressures is caused mainly by the low partial pressure of oxygen, resulting in hypoxia (Navarro and Calderon, 1979). The partial pressure of oxygen has a decisive effect on insect mortality, while no significant function could be attributed to the low pressure itself. At 50 mm of Hg, the partial pressure of oxygen is equivalent to 1.4% O2, this being similar to the target itself. At 50 mm of Hg, the partial pressure of oxygen has a decisive effect on insect mortality, while hypoxia (Navarro and Calderon, 1979). The partial pressure of oxygen mainly by the low partial pressure of oxygen, resulting in hypoxia and hypercarbia on T. castaneum adults, a period of 2.7 hr was necessary.

The egg stages of Lasioderma serricorne (the cigarette beetle) (Bare, 1948) and Trogoderma variabile (Cline and Highland, 1987) were the most tolerant life stage when exposed to low pressures. In the work of Finkelman et al. (2003b), the egg stage of E. cautella and T. castaneum was found to be most resistant to 55 ± 10 mm of Hg at 18°C; the times needed to obtain egg mortality of 99% were 96 and 149 hr, respectively. In contrast, the adult stage of O. surinamensis was the most resistant, with 164 hr being required to obtain 99% mortality. Finkelman et al. (2004) showed that less than three days under 50 mm of Hg at 30°C would control all stages of E. cautella, P. interpunctella, and T. castaneum. The times obtained to achieve 99% mortality were 45, 49, and 22 hr, respectively. The eggs of all three species were most resistant to low pressure. Mbata and Phillips (2001) exposed eggs, larvae, and pupae of T. castaneum, P. interpunctella, and R. dominica to 32.5 mm of Hg at temperatures ranging from 25 to 40°C. Eggs of R. dominica were most tolerant to low pressure; 134.7 and 86 hr were required for 90% mortality at 25 and 40°C, respectively.

According to Finkelman et al. (2005), for Trogoderma granarium, L. serricorne, and O. surinamensis at 50 mm of Hg and 30°C, the egg was the most-resistant stage, the times needed to obtain 99% mortality being 46, 91, and 32 hr, respectively. Adults of T. granarium and L. serricorne and pupae of O. surinamensis were the most susceptible.

**Effects of High Pressure**

Extremely short exposure times (a few hours) are needed to control all stages of storage insects with carbon dioxide at pressures between 10 and 37 bar. Generally, increasing the pressure reduces the lethal exposure time. Stahl et al. (1985) and Stahl and Rau (1985) were the first to report that pressurized carbon dioxide is lethal to insects, Stahl and coworkers (Rau, 1985; Stahl and Rau, 1985; Stahl et al., 1985; Gerard et al., 1988a,b) tested carbon dioxide under high pressure to kill insects and microbes.

Developmental stages of *L. serricorne*, *O. surinamensis*, *T. castaneum*, *T. confusum*, *Trogoderma granarium*, *Corycyra cephalonica* (the rice moth), *Ephestia elutella*, *E. cautella*, *P. interpunctella*, and *Sitotroga cerealella* (Angoumois grain moth) were exposed (at a temperature of 20°C) to carbon dioxide at 37 bar for 20 min, 30 bar for 1 hr, and 20 bar for 3 hr. These treatments resulted in 100% mortality of all insects. Survivors of *T. confusum* were found after treatment with 10 bar for 20 hr. Therefore, Adler et al (2000) concluded that extrapolation of laboratory results for carbon dioxide and high pressures to field situations is risky. The rate of decompression of pressurized chambers also have an adverse impact on insect mortality (Ulrichs, 1994; Ulrichs et al, 1997a,b).

Treatment with high-pressure carbon dioxide under different temperatures may result in different rates of mortality. For example, at 15°C, 95% mortality of *L. serricorne* was observed after 38.5 min of treatment, while the same level of control was achieved within 1 min at 45°C (Ulrichs, 1995).

With high pressures (20–40 bar), all types of pests and their life stages can be killed within a short time. The relatively rapid control of pests in all stages of development is based, on one hand, on the narcotic and acidifying effect induced by the high solubility of carbon dioxide in cell fluid and, on the other hand, on the destruction of the cells following the carbon dioxide pressure treatment during depressurization (Adler et al, 2000).

### Biochemical Effects

The mortality of insects exposed to MAs involves a complex metabolic response. There is evidence that low-humidity environments are more effective in causing mortality (Navarro and Calderon, 1973, 1974; Navarro, 1975) and that, at low humidity, the lethal effects can be attributed to desiccation rather than to the toxic action of the MAs (Navarro, 1978). However, the inability of insects to recover after treatment was also attributed to the lack of sufficient triglycerides as substrates for energy metabolism (Navarro and Friedlander, 1974; Friedlander and Navarro, 1978, 1979a,b; Donahaye, 1991). Physiologically, organisms may react to anoxia by using alternative pathways such as the α-triglycerophosphate pathway for anaerobic energy production (Friedlander and Navarro, 1974). In this way, even at very low oxygen levels, the enormous reduction of energy consumption allows insect to survive much longer than vertebrates.

Navarro and Friedlander (1975) exposed pupae of *Cadra cautella* (the almond moth) for 24 hr to atmospheres with 10% oxygen and 20–89% carbon dioxide by volume; nitrogen made up the remaining volume. They found increasing lactate levels in the hemolymph with increasing carbon dioxide contents in the atmosphere. However, in a nitrogen atmosphere, lactate levels were found to increase sharply as soon as the oxygen level was reduced below 3% (Navarro and Friedlander, 1975). This suggested that lethal exposure times for various stored-product insects might increase sharply in nitrogen atmospheres with more than 3–4% oxygen (Lindgren and Vincent, 1970).

In another study, glucose levels in *Cadra cautella* were found to be reduced during anoxia but constant in atmospheres rich in carbon dioxide. Malate levels were increased when the insect was exposed to high concentrations of carbon dioxide (hypercarbic), but those levels decreased under low-oxygen (hypoxic) atmospheres. Citrate levels were reduced in both anoxic and hypercarbic atmospheres (Friedlander and Navarro, 1979a,b), which is probably a consequence of these atmospheres inhibiting the Kreb’s cycle. Other studies by Friedlander and coworkers deal with the influence of CAs on the lipid content, water loss (Friedlander and Navarro, 1978), tissue levels of free amino acids, effects on the sorbitol pathway (Friedlander and Navarro, 1983), effects on the NADPH production (Friedlander et al, 1984), and glutathione levels (Friedlander and Navarro, 1984).

When pupae of *S. granarius* were exposed to pure nitrogen or pure carbon dioxide, lactate levels were found to increase most strongly within the first 24 hr of anoxia (Adler, 1993, 1994a,b). After 24 hr, accumulated lactate levels in CO2-treated pupae were about one-third of those in N2-treated pupae.

The comparatively lower lactate levels seen in *S. granarius* pupae exposed to CO2 were attributed to acidosis caused by a combination of carbonic acid and lactic acid, which in nitrogen-treated pupae was attained by the accumulation of greater amounts of lactic acid alone (Adler, 1993). Friedlander (1984) noted that both pyruvate and lactate levels increased in pupae of *Cadra cautella* exposed to 99% nitrogen and 1% oxygen. In an atmosphere of 90% CO2 and 10% oxygen, lactate levels in *Cadra cautella* pupae were four times higher than in pupae exposed to air, and two times higher than in pupae exposed to nitrogen. These results may indicate that the level of oxygen is important for the amounts of lactate and thus for the degree of acidosis produced by an atmosphere rich in CO2.

Fat tissue represents a considerable proportion of the body weight of pupae and adults of the flour beetle. Villeneuve and Lemonde (1963) determined that lipids form up to 20% of the wet body weight of *T. confusum* and that they are the major source of energy during metamorphosis. Gilbert (1967) noted that triacylglycerols (TGs), which are released by hydrolysis and fatty acid production, form an important energy source for insects. These acids then release further energy by oxidation. Kennington and Cannell (1967) showed that, during exposure of *Tribolium* pupae to anoxia, lipids did not provide an energy source; however, as soon as the insects were returned to air, lipids were utilized in quantity. The accepted belief is that carbohydrate reserves in insects are utilized by the glycolytic pathway during anaerobic metabolism, but little information is available in the literature on lipid and carbohydrate metabolism under stress of hypoxia and hypercarbia.

The function of TGs in the conservation of the water balance in insects has been discussed by Edney (1967) and
by Wigglesworth (1972). Friedlander and Navarro (1979a) examined the influence of CO₂ on TG metabolism in E. cautella pupae, to determine whether water production from TG metabolism forms a regulatory mechanism to compensate for increased water loss due to the influence of CO₂ on spiracular openings. They found that TG metabolism was not sufficient to compensate for water losses under conditions of high CO₂ concentration and low ambient humidity.

Glycogen forms one of the major carbohydrate energy reserves in insects. Friedman (1970) noted that glycogen may form from 0.01% to more than 2% of the wet weight of insects. Other important carbohydrates stored by insects are chitin and trehalose. Villeneuve and Lemone (1965) identified carbohydrate reserves in T. confusum pupae. They found trehalose in considerable quantities, while the most abundant aldohexose was 6-deoxyglucose. The polysaccharides they identified by electrophoresis were similar to amylose and amylpectin and different from glycogen.

Friedlander and Navarro (1979b) measured glycogen concentrations after exposure of E. cautella pupae to hypoxia and hypercarbia. They found that hypercarbia increased glycogen utilization and that hypoxia made it more intensified. Glucose levels were not influenced by hypercarbia but rose significantly during exposure to hypoxia.

Physiological Effects

Resistance to MA

Resistance of stored-product insects to contact insecticides and fumigants has been well documented. Therefore, the question as to whether these insects are able to develop resistance to alternative control measures is pertinent. Bond and Buckland (1979) were the first to show that stored-product insects have the genetic potential to develop resistance to MAAs. Their study obtained a threefold increase in resistance to MA after they had selected for seven generations. Similar results were obtained by Navarro et al (1985a) for resistance of S. oryzae to hypercarbia by selection over 10 generations.

A long-term study of the development of resistance by laboratory strains of T. castaneum to hypoxia and to hypercarbia was carried out by Donahaye (1990a,b) and Donahaye et al (1992a) and included investigations into the mechanisms of resistance.

Laboratory-induced resistance of a strain of T. castaneum to hypoxia. The laboratory-induced resistance to hypoxia by adults of T. castaneum was studied by Donahaye (1985, 1990a). Selection over 40 generations produced a strain resistant to an atmosphere containing 65% CO₂, 20% O₂, and 15% N₂ at 95% RH, termed the “high carbon dioxide concentration (HCC)-selected” strain. At the 40th generation, adults of the HCC-selected strain had an RF of 9.2 at the LT₅₀ level when compared with the laboratory strain from which the HCC strain had been selected.

In his study, Donahaye (1990b) showed that weight loss occurred during exposure to HCC. Even though the exposure was carried out at 95% RH, precisely to avoid the desiccation factor, the insects were nonetheless susceptible to desiccation. The water content of the dead insect in equilibrium with 95% RH was approximately 25%, whereas this finding indicates that the live insect needs to maintain a water content of 55%.

The unselected strain was unable to control water loss. Mobilization of TG reserves was rapid but was almost exhausted within 96 hr, indicating that the attempt to mobilize water reserves was insufficient to prevent desiccation. In sharp contrast, the HCC-selected strain was able to maintain a water balance over a much longer time period. Thus, if CO₂ acts on the nerves of the spiracular muscle (Burkett and Schneiderman, 1967), then it is possible that the resistant strain is able to overcome this and close its spiracles, while the susceptible strain cannot. Furthermore, TG reserves per insect were significantly greater in the HCC-selected strain and their mobilization was slower, indicating a better control mechanism for the maintenance of water balance.

It is suggested, therefore, that the eventual mortality of the selected strain was due to exhaustion of energy reserves and that an important aspect of the selection process is the favoring of those insects that build up greater reserves and expend them more slowly. The other resistance mechanisms, as suggested earlier, are likely to be compensatory mechanisms against the physiological and biochemical effects of hypoxia and hypercarbia, as well as spiracular control or possibly other adaptations limiting water loss.

Effect on Development

Low-oxygen atmospheres significantly retard development, this effect being particularly noticeable under slower rates of development. Nitrogen has an anesthetic effect that produces immobilization after a brief period of hyperactivity (Ali Niæze and Lindgren, 1970; Storey, 1975a). A reduction in or suspension of development occurs during
the exposure period. Presumably, insects lessen their oxygen consumption to avoid the effects of anoxia. In a review article on hypoxia in marine invertebrates, Herreid (1980) developed the classic viewpoint that aerobic animals are either metabolic conformers or metabolic regulators. Physiological compensation may include a lower metabolic rate or reduction in metabolic activity during hypoxia, thus leading to conservation of energy and O2. A positive correlation between metabolic rates and mortality due to 100% CO2 and a negative correlation between body weights and metabolic rates were shown to exist for S. granarius laboratory-selected for resistance to methyl bromide (Upitis et al, 1973). These mechanisms resulted in greater body weight, extended life cycle, and lower respiratory rate in the resistant strain. Also for the LOC-selected strain, Donahaye (1990b) showed that the pupal and adult stages were significantly heavier, oviposition rate was lower, and respiratory rates in air were significantly lower than those of the unselected strain. Possible physiological compensation measures during exposure that were not investigated include increased O2 transport (including maintenance of tracheal pumping), transfer across cell membranes, or transport in the hemolymph by increased heart pumping.

During anoxia, the development of insects virtually ceases, and survival depends only on the capacity to accumulate glycolytic products and to reduce metabolism needs. However, stored-product insects placed under anoxic atmospheres suffer a loss of body water that is strongly correlated with the mortality rate (Navarro, 1978) (Fig. 3). With sublethal periods of exposure to anoxia, a period of time is necessary, following the return to a normal atmosphere at the end of the treatment, for the recovery of vital functions. This time is needed for the recuperation of a normal aerobic metabolism (Bailey and Banks, 1980).

Respiratory Metabolism

Emekci et al (2002) showed that respiration of T. castaneum was suppressed at O2 levels lower than 5% in eggs and young larvae (Fig. 9). Pupal respiration of T. castaneum decreased as O2 concentrations fell. Similar results concerning respiration of E. cautella pupae were reported at reduced O2 atmospheres at 26°C and 93–99% RH (Navarro and Calderon, 1979). Accordingly, CO2 production by E. cautella was approximately 0.1, 0.2, and 0.35 µL/100 mg·hr–1 at O2 concentrations of 1, 3, and 21%, respectively.

The increased respiration rate of T. castaneum adults at 3 and 5% O2 was considered by Emekci et al (2002) as a compensatory response to the O2 deficiency. Donahaye (1992) provided data on studies of the physiological differences between strains of adult T. castaneum unselected and selected for hypoxia and hypercarbia at 26°C and 95% RH. Carlson (1968), comparing different ratios of percent CO2 and percent N2, measured less CO2 production (than in the control) in T. confusum adults at 30°C in atmospheres of 4.91, 10.15, and 14.90% O2. His CO2 measurements for these O2 levels were between 1.74 and 1.88 µL/mg·hr–1, similar to the results of Emekci et al (2002).

Respiration rates of immature stages of R. dominica increased proportionally as the O2 concentration increased from 1 to 21% (Fig. 10). Respiration of eggs was particularly suppressed at low O2 levels of 3% or less. CO2 production per hour in eggs in 1% O2 was found to be 9.7 times less than that in 21% O2. Emekci et al (1998) obtained a similar respiratory response in T. castaneum, where CO2 production of eggs in 1% O2 was nine times less than that in 21% O2. In young larvae, CO2 production was adversely affected and respiration decreased by 8.2 times when the O2 concentration decreased from 21 to 1%. Results obtained for pupae showed that T. castaneum respiration under the same conditions was more stable than in that of R. dominica, increasing by only 1.5 times, when O2 concentrations increased from 1 to 21% (Emekci et al, 1998, 2004).

Behavioral Effects

Sublethal Effects

Many researchers have reported that high mortalities under low-O2 conditions were obtained only after long exposures for all development stages (Calderon and Navarro, 1979; Bailey and Banks, 1980; Annis, 1987; Donahaye et al, 1996). Soderstrom and Brandl (1982) observed that 1% O2 prevented feeding of larvae of the navel orange worm, Amyelois transitella. Emekci et al (2002) showed suppressed respiration at low O2 levels, allowing T. castaneum to survive. In this respect, Calderon and Navarro (1980) reported that the egg stage of T. castaneum was more susceptible than its adult to reduced O2.
concentrations, and 100% mortality of eggs was obtained only after 96 hr at 2–4% O₂ levels. Tunc and Navarro (1983) found that exposure of newly laid up-to-one-day-old T. castaneum eggs to 2–4% O₂ at 26°C and 20, 50, and 95% RH caused complete mortality after 96 hr. Jay and Cuff (1981) reported that, upon exposure to ~1% O₂ at 27°C and 60% RH for 24 hr, mortalities for 16- to 20-day-old larvae, for three- to six-day-old pupae, and for two- to 14-day-old adults of T. castaneum were 11.2, 26, and 99.2%, respectively. Navarro (1978) obtained high mortality (95%) of T. castaneum adults at 1% O₂ in N₂ only after 96 hr at 26°C and 54% RH.

Calderon and Navarro (1980) reported that mortality in R. dominica eggs at 2, 4, and 6% O₂ in N₂ was 75, 85, and 50% after 96 hr of exposure, respectively, at 26°C and 55% RH. They also reported that adult mortality was below 10% under the same conditions. Bailey (1965) reported no mortality of R. dominica adults at 32°C after exposure to O₂ levels higher than 6%. As the O₂ concentration gradually decreased, mortality increased progressively, reaching 100% at 2% O₂ after 14 days of exposure. Annis and Dowsett (1993) reported that, in R. dominica, high mortalities for all developmental stages could be obtained only with O₂ concentrations below 1%. These results would support the view that all development stages of R. dominica were alive when their respiration rates were measured (Emekci et al, 2004).

Insect Response to Gas Gradients

The distribution of insects within a grain mass following a treatment of MA was studied to determine whether storage insects are able to escape the treatment or concentrate in preferred spots that permit their survival. Shejbal et al (1973) reported that adult beetles exposed to treatments with nitrogen and 0.5% oxygen tended to accumulate close to the point of gas introduction at the top of the silo. Navarro (1977) and Navarro et al (1981) studied the dispersion capacity of adults of S. oryzae, R. dominica, and O. surinamensis along a low-oxygen or a high-carbon-dioxide gradient in a wheat grain column 1 m high. S. oryzae and R. dominica did not respond to the presence of gradients and moved regardless of the presence of a low oxygen or high carbon dioxide concentration. However, the vertical distribution of adult O. surinamensis was inhibited by hypoxic or hypercarbic atmospheres. The authors also mentioned the accumulation of insects around leaks in the walls of a steel silo bin treated with an inert gas. In experiments with adults of S. granarius released into the center of a vertical grain column, Adler (1992, 1993) found a hypoxic atmosphere with 1% oxygen to be attractive to insects. This effect was markedly stronger when the gas mixture was introduced from the top rather than when it was flushed into the column from the bottom. A gas mixture with 80% nitrogen, 19% carbon dioxide, and 1% oxygen was found to have moderately repellent and arresting properties (Adler, 1992, 1993). In experiments in rectangular and circular arenas, it was found that adults of S. granarius preferred to stay in zones with higher oxygen levels (up to 10% oxygen in nitrogen or pressurized air) as long as the atmosphere was not made narcotic by oxygen levels below 2% or by high CO₂ levels (Adler, 1993).

Disinfestation Effect by Insect Removal from the Treated Commodity

The influence of different CAs in causing emigration of Carpophilus larvae from dates was compared with that of methyl bromide (MB) by Navarro et al (1989) and Donahaye et al (1991a). The treatment’s effect on emigration from infested fruit is no less important than the toxic effect because established tolerances set minimum acceptance levels for the presence of both dead and live insects. To study the effectiveness in causing emigration of Carpophilus larvae from dates, a number of CA treatments and MB were compared by Navarro et al (1998b).

Emigration results under low atmospheric pressure and under low O₂ concentration were similar for the treatments carried out on dates and artificial feeding sites. Results of these treatments differed significantly from the control and from those of the CO₂-treated groups. Carpophilus larvae appear to seek out and penetrate their food substrate through cracks and crevices and then remain largely sedentary, thus creating a niche in which they feed until they begin to wander before pupation. Premature emigration from the feeding sites takes place under exposure to MB, low pressures, and low O₂ concentration. These treatments place the larva under stress, which interrupts their feeding and causes them to wander.

EFFECTS OF MA ON PRODUCT QUALITY

Germination of Seeds

Seeds stored at moisture contents in equilibrium with relative humidities below 65% are not damaged by storage fungi since these organisms require higher moisture contents (Lacey et al, 1980). Generally, the lower the moisture content and the lower the temperature, the longer the seed can be stored (Copeland and McDonald, 1985).

Seeds below their critical moisture content are not significantly affected by high-CO₂ or low-O₂ atmospheres (Banks, 1981; Fleurat-Lessard et al, 1994). However, with increasing grain-moisture contents, carbon-dioxide-rich atmospheres could reduce the physiological quality of grain by interfering with the enzymatic activity of glutamine-decarboxylase (Münzing and Bolling, 1985). Laboratory studies have demonstrated that 60% CO₂ in air at 60°C slightly reduces seed longevity compared with that in N₂-based atmospheres (Hough et al, 1971; Shejbal, 1980b). The adverse effect of CO₂ on germination of rice, maize (corn), and wheat becomes more pronounced at temperatures higher than 47°C and, from the observations carried out so far, this adverse effect may not be detectable at all below 30°C (Banks and Annis, 1990). Therefore, if preservation of germination is of primary importance, the use of CO₂-free low-O₂ atmospheres is preferable.

Hermetic storage of seeds modifies the atmospheric composition surrounding them by depleting the oxygen through the respiration of insects, molds, and seeds. The atmosphere within the storage container therefore becomes insecticidal, fungistatic, or fungicidal. Moreno et al (1988) showed that maize seeds stored at moisture contents between 15.3 and 17.7% were not invaded by fungi when
stored under hermetic conditions and maintained a higher viability than seeds with similar moisture contents not stored hermetically. Corn stored for 90 days at a 15.3% moisture content maintained a viability of 95% under hermetic conditions, compared to viability that dropped to 43% in samples kept under nonhermetic conditions (Moreno et al., 1988).

Under the high humidity of the tropics, microflora commonly invade stored seeds (Mendoza et al., 1982). Therefore, the problems of maintaining seed viability in storage have always been an important concern to farmers and seed growers in the developing countries due to inadequate storage facilities. Under hermetic-storage conditions, storage insects can develop a storage atmosphere lethal to themselves before they cause damage to the germination of seeds. In Israel, plastic structures have been developed suitable for long-term storage systems, as well as for intermediate storage of grain in bags or bulk for cooperatives and subsistence farmers (Navarro et al., 1990). For small-scale applications, these plastic structures use flexible liners (Navarro et al., 2002a). Predictive models have been developed to determine the response of insects to gastightness levels (Navarro et al., 1994).

**Corn Storage Trials in Thailand and in the Philippines**

Viability of corn stored under hermetic (148 days of storage) and nonhermetic (120 days of storage) conditions in the Philippines did not significantly change between the initial and final samples. The temperature inside the control stack kept under a nonhermetic tarp was 28°C, and temperatures under the hermetic conditions were in the range of 29–31°C. In the hermetic storage, the CO₂ level rapidly increased to 12%, while the O₂ concentration sharply declined to around 7% over the first two weeks of storage. On the basis of viability tests and insect infestations, storage under hermetic conditions was considered successful, in comparison with the control stacks (Navarro and Caliboso, 1996; Navarro et al., 1998a) (Table 5).

**Paddy Storage Trials in the Philippines and in Cambodia**

To test the viability of paddy rice stored under hermetic and nonhermetic conditions, two trials were carried out in the Philippines, one lasting for 117 days and the other for 187 days (Navarro and Caliboso, 1996; Navarro et al., 1997a). Viability of paddy stored under hermetic conditions did not change significantly during the trials. Only a slight reduction was observed in the viability of paddy in the control.

The tests in Cambodia lasted for 223 days, during which a slight increase in moisture content was observed under the hermetic conditions and a significant increase of 2 percentage points of moisture content (from 13 to 15%) in the control stack. This significant increase in moisture content apparently influenced the sharp decrease in viability of the paddy in the control stack, from 95% at the start of the trial to 66% at the end of the trial. However, the hermetic seal preserved the germination capacity, and the drop was only from 97 to 91% for the same period (S. Bunna, personal communication, CARDI, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, 2001) (Table 5).

**Wheat Storage Trials**

To test the viability of wheat stored under hermetic conditions in Israel, two trials were carried out, with storage periods of 1,440 and 450 days and only under hermetic conditions. In trial I, the viability of wheat changed only slightly, from the initial 99% to 97% at the end of 1,440 days. In trial II, the wheat viability dropped slightly, from an initial level of 97% to 91% at the end of the storage

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commodity</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Storage Condition</th>
<th>Length of Trial (days)</th>
<th>Initial Germination (%)</th>
<th>Germination at End of Trial (%)</th>
<th>Moisture Content at Start of Trial (%)</th>
<th>Moisture Content at End of Trial (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maize</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trial I</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>13.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trial I</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trial II</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paddy</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trial I</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trial II</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wheat</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>Hermetic</td>
<td>1,440</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Nonhermetic</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Source: Navarro et al (2002a); used by permission.

b Data from Sukprakarni et al (1998).

c Data from Navarro and Caliboso (1996).

d Data from S. Bunna, CARADI, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, personal communication (2001).
period. In both trials, insect populations were successfully controlled; the average CO₂ concentrations ranged between 10 and 15% (Navarro and Caliboso, 1996) (Table 5).

**Product Quality Preservation**

Several trials were performed to determine the quality changes of treated cocoa beans and hazelnuts (Ziegleder, 1991). Accelerated tests for storability under high-pressure CO₂ were simulated at 35°C for three months. The tested qualities of cocoa beans did not change significantly. Only treated hazelnuts showed a tendency to turn rancid earlier than untreated samples. All other tested criteria of these products remained unchanged. Similar findings were reported for many other food products exposed to high-pressure CO₂ (Gerard et al., 1988a,b, 1990; Pohlen et al., 1989).

Data about the comparative effects of low-O₂ and high-CO₂ atmospheres on end-use parameters are very limited. Generally, low-O₂ atmospheres preserve quality better than air (Duff et al., 1986; Richard-Molard et al., 1987), but there are some indications that the effects of CO₂-rich atmospheres should be checked before use in unfamiliar conditions. For instance, Shejbal (1980b) warns of (unspecified) detrimental effects on quality. Wheat held for long periods under unfavorable storage conditions and high-CO₂ atmospheres yielded flour with a much longer mixing time than that stored under the same O₂ concentration in N₂ only. CO₂ was at one time suspected of causing increased yellowing of rice in storage, but laboratory studies suggest that this is not so (Bason et al., 1987; Banks and Annis, 1990).

Donahaye et al. (2001) reported on quality preservation of paddy rice stored in stacks of 13.4–31.9 tonnes (t) in flexible enclosures outdoors for 78–183 days. The quality of the paddy was compared with that of three control stacks (5.3–5.6 t capacity) held under tarpaulins in the open for 78–117 days. The trials were conducted at the NAPHIRE compound, Nueva Ecija, the Philippines. The enclosures consisted of heavy-duty polyvinyl chloride (PVC)-based sheeting sufficiently gastight to control insect infestations. Initial and final samples were taken to determine changes in paddy quality; insect infestation, fungal infection, milling recovery, head rice, yellow kernels, brokens, germination, and weight loss were analyzed. Percent milling recovery and levels of yellowing in the gastight stacks showed no significant change. The levels of head rice and brokens were preserved in seven out of nine stacks. A decrease in percent of head rice in two stacks was attributed to the biological aging phenomenon. The two control stacks showed a decrease in head rice and an increase in brokens. Rice yellowing was very pronounced in one of the control stacks.

**Sorption of Carbon Dioxide**

Jay (1980) found that sorption of CO₂ by grain makes the gas effective against insect species whose immature stages feed inside the kernel. The adsorption mechanism of CO₂ into the grain has been found to be very similar to that observed in sorptions of gases by charcoal and silica gel (Mitsuda et al., 1973). The sorption phenomenon causes the removal of some molecules of gas from the free space in the treated enclosure, which causes a progressive lowering of the concentration (partial pressure) of the gas in the free space.

**Effect on Changes in Pressure of the Treated Container**

Banks et al. (1980) observed an initial rapid decay of concentration shortly after CO₂ was purged into large bins containing wheat. This initial rapid decay seemed to be associated with sorption of the CO₂ by the grain. Characteristics of CO₂ sorption by stored wheat were studied by Cofie-Agblo et al. (1993, 1995) and by Yamamoto and Mitsuda (1980). Typical reduced pressures created by sorption in the gastight containers were shown by Navarro (1997b). Since the amount of CO₂ sorbed is proportional to the amount of grain in the container at a given partial pressure of CO₂ and temperature, the resulting reduced pressure is also proportional to the void space of the system. Therefore, the drop in pressure can represent the experimental conditions only when the grain bulk volume occupies 93% of the total container capacity. Under these conditions, the lowest pressure recorded was 520 mm of Hg at 15°C (Navarro, 1997b) (Fig. 11). The sorption rate changed inversely with the temperature of the wheat, and the highest absolute pressure of 606 mm of Hg was obtained at 30°C. Mitsuda and Yamamoto (1980) reported that a 0.8-L container filled with grain (apparently rice) developed a negative pressure of 0.27 kg/cm² after seven days. This negative pressure in terms of absolute pressure at standard temperature and pressure conditions was calculated to be about 555 mm of Hg.

**Corrosion Potential of Carbon Dioxide**

Carbon dioxide reacts with moisture during bulk-grain treatment until an equilibrium is established between dissolved and atmospheric carbon dioxide. It is reported that carbon dioxide is absorbed into new concrete structures (Spratt, 1975), and, in moist concrete walls, carbonic acid formed from carbon dioxide could corrode metal structures. CO₂ reacts with basic calcium compounds in new concrete to give calcium carbonate (Hamada, 1968). The pro-
cess, known as carbonation, has no parallel in N₂-based atmospheres. Carbonation can potentially lead to corrosion of reinforcing steel in concrete buildings, such as silos, with consequent weakening or failure. However, Banks and McCabe (1988) argued that, although carbonation occurs in concrete storages, it does not appear to affect them adversely. In new concrete structures, the carbonation reaction can take up substantial quantities of CO₂, leading to increased usage of CO₂ to create a given high-CO₂ atmosphere. It has been calculated (Banks and McCabe, 1988) that a new 2,800-t concrete bin can take up about 7 t of CO₂, about 2.5 times the quantity normally used to give a 70% CO₂ atmosphere when the structure contains wheat. The exact quantity taken up depends on the structural design and concrete specifications. A pressure reduction of more than 3 kPa in 0.5 hr has been observed (Banks and McCabe, 1988) in a well-sealed bin, attributable to CO₂ uptake by the concrete of the structure.

**GENERATION AND APPLICATION OF MA**

**Generation of MA**

The objective of MA treatment is to attain atmospheric gases rich in CO₂ and low in O₂, or a combination of these two gases within the storage enclosure or treatment chamber, for the time necessary to control the storage pests. At present, the most widely used source for production of such atmospheric gas compositions is tanker-delivered liquefied CO₂ or N₂. The availability and suitability of this means of gas supply must be questioned when the gases are transported over long distances from an industrial production area to the storage site. Therefore, alternative potential methods of generating MAs should also be considered.

**From Tankers**

When the target MA gas composition is <1% O₂ or a high CO₂ concentration, a commonly used method is to supply N₂ or CO₂ from pressurized tankers. The practical aspects of purging grain storages have been described by Guiffre and Segal (1984) for CO₂ and by Banks et al (1980) for N₂ and CO₂. A significant portion of the cost of applying MAs generated from tankers is for transportation and on-site purging. Bulk liquid gas is transported in conventionally insulated road tankers.

For large-scale application of N₂ or CO₂, vaporizers are essential. These vaporizers consist of a suitably designed receptacle with a heating medium (electricity, steam, diesel fuel, or propane), a hot-water-jacketed super-heated coil, and forced or natural draft. A forced-draft-type of vaporizer with electrical super heating was found to be convenient (Guiffre and Segal, 1984).

**From Exothermic Gas Generators**

For on-site generation of MAs by combustion of hydrocarbon fuel to produce a low-O₂ atmosphere containing some CO₂, commercial installations (termed “exothermic gas generators” or “gas burners”) are available. Such equipment was originally designed for MA storage of fresh fruits. It allows the presence of 2–3% O₂ and removes CO₂ through scrubbers. Therefore, its use in the grain industry requires several adaptations, such as adjusting the equipment to obtain an O₂ level of <1%, taking full advantage of the CO₂ generated, and removing excessive humidity from the generated atmosphere. Combustion of propane yields approximately 13% CO₂ and combustion of butane yields approximately 15% CO₂. The MA generated is more toxic than is an N₂ atmosphere deficient in O₂. This is because the presence of CO₂ in the MA causes hypercarbia; hypercarbia and hypoxia together are synergistic in their effect on insect mortality (Calderon and Navarro 1979, 1980; Bell, 1984; Navarro and Jay, 1987). Equipment has been designed to operate with open-flame burners, with catalytic burners, and as an internal combustion system. Full-scale field trials using open-flame burners (Storey, 1973; Fleurat-Lessard and Le Torc’h, 1987) and catalytic burners (Navarro et al, 1979) to provide a low-O₂ gas mixture have proven successful. Open-flame burners are capable of producing high gas-flow rates at a low O₂ tension. Consequently, the generated MA can be applied directly to purge the treated enclosure. On the other hand, catalytic systems reduce the O₂ concentration in the atmosphere by a fixed fraction during passage through the catalyst and therefore preferably should be used in a recirculation system. The development of a modified internal-combustion engine for MA generation has been reported (Banks, 1984a). In spite of its advantages over the open-flame and catalytic burners as an easily operated, transportable, and independent system, information on field application of such a combustion system is lacking.

**From On-Site N₂ Generators**

Commercial equipment, also termed “pressure-swing adsorption” systems, using the process of O₂ adsorption from compressed air passed through a molecular sieve bed, is available (Zanon, 1980). For continuous operation, a set of two adsorbers is provided; these operate sequentially for O₂ adsorption and regeneration. N₂ at a purity of 99.9% can be obtained through regulation of inlet airflow. Equipment is now manufactured that is rated to supply an outlet flow rate of 120 m³/hr at an outlet purity of 98% N₂. However, in view of the high capital investment involved, it would seem wise to undertake a long-term cost-benefit analysis to explore the justification of using these installations.

**Biogeneration of MAs**

Two principal forms of biogeneration of MAs exist, namely, “hermetic storage” and “assisted hermetic storage.”

**Hermetic storage.** A high level of gastightness is required for a structure to be suitable for hermetic storage of dry grain. The effect of restricted air supply on storage insects was studied by Oxley and Wickenden (1963), who suggested that, in leaky structures, it is necessary to increase the rate of O₂ consumption to a level at which insect infestation cannot persist. Burrell (1980) concluded that sealing infested grain using hermetic storage to kill the insects can be satisfactory for a heavy infestation in warm grain but is likely to prove uneconomical for light infestations or when the grain is cool, because of the long storage period required before complete kill is obtained. To obtain complete control of all insects in order to eliminate the danger of renewed infestation of grain removed from the
hermetic container, Banks (1984a) proposed a possible solution of increasing consumption of O₂ by artificially infesting the grain with insects. Similarly, Burrell (1980) intentionally wetted a small region of the stored commodity. Because part of the commodity is sacrificed for the generation of the MA, Banks (1984a) has termed this type of storage “hermetic storage with sacrificial areas.” However, experience has shown us that, for hermetic storage in flexible plastic storage systems under subtropical climatic conditions, hermetic storage of grain continues to offer an excellent solution, provided there is a certain degree of tolerance of the presence of insects at critical areas in the storage structure (e.g., at the grain surface, where moisture condensation is likely to occur). At the end of long-term hermetic storage, when the unloaded grain is destined for immediate consumption, the risk of spreading insect infestation was found to be negligible. The success of insect control by hermetic storage treatments is comparable to that of conventional fumigants (99.9% kill), and losses due to insect activity are minimal (0.15% loss in weight for a storage period of 15 months) (Navarro et al, 1984).

**Assisted hermetic storage.** The term “assisted hermetic storage” was introduced by Banks (1984a) to define a process in which MA generation is assisted by a biogenerator source without sacrificing the commodity. Using a similar approach, Calderon et al (1981) examined the possibility of generating an MA by inoculating wet rice bran. The best-known working example of assisted hermetic storage is that used in China (Lu, 1984). With this method, removal of O₂ is achieved by recirculating storage gases through a closed system containing racks of moist grain and bran infected with a particular mold culture. This MA generation system merits further attention to explore potential applications at locations where a regular supply of industrial gases is nonexistent or economically unfeasible.

**Potential Systems for the Generation of MA**

Less commercialized, or potential, methods for the generation of MAs have been discussed by Banks (1984a). They include extraction of N₂ from the low-O₂ exhaust stream produced by the combustion of hydrocarbons in air (Zanon, 1980), catalytic oxidation of ammonia, hydrogen combustion, direct electrolytic or catalytic removal of O₂, removal of O₂ by chemical reaction, producer gas combustion systems to generate CO₂, combustion of methane derived from fermentation, burning carbon-containing materials in air, burning coal or charcoal in O₂, and production of CO₂ from fermentation.

**Methods for Applying Modified Atmospheres**

**Prerequisites for Application to Grain Stored in Bulk**

**Choice of atmospheric gas composition.** A simple and descriptive graphical presentation to illustrate the relationship between exposure period, O₂ and CO₂ concentrations (at normal atmospheric pressure), and the mortality of different insect life stages was compiled from the literature by Annis (1987). In his review, he proposed provisional dosage regimes at grain temperatures of 20–29°C.

A summary of these dosage regimes is given in Table 6, which shows that the use of an atmosphere with less than 1% O₂ requires considerably longer exposure times than 80% CO₂ atmospheres to kill insect populations other than *Trogoderma granarium*. The basis for preparing these regimes was the time response of the most tolerant developmental stage of the most tolerant insect species. In the absence of *Trogoderma granarium*, a low-O₂ regime should be based on the response of *S. oryzae* pupae, while the CO₂ regimes should be based on *T. castaneum* adults and larvae (Annis, 1987; Navarro and Jay, 1987).

The dosage regimes presented in Table 6 should be viewed as very generalized recommendations. More recently published information (Navarro and Jay, 1987; Reichmuth, 1997; Bell et al, 2003) indicates that further work is needed to enable precise dosage recommendations to be established for the application of MAs for the major stored-product insects under the wide range of intrinsic and extrinsic factors involved. Thus, recommended dosage regimes should be based on temperature ranges appropriate to specific climatic conditions and also to the dominant insect species found in the commodities involved. Aspects of commodity moisture content (Navarro, 1978; Navarro et al, 1994; Adler et al, 2000; Donahaye et al, 2000), socio-economically acceptable control levels, the time-frame within which the control must be accomplished, and the expected leak-rate standard under which the MA treatment will be performed will probably all play important roles in future recommendations.

In contrast to the conventional application of MAs at normal atmospheric pressure, the use of pressurized CO₂ in high-pressure chambers for control of *P. interpunctella* and *L. serricorne* was demonstrated (Gerard et al, 1988b). With this method, CO₂ is applied at pressures of 10–50 bar. Complete control of all stages of the tested insects was achieved after 20 min of exposure at 50 bar (Stahl et al, 1985). The special equipment needed to withstand the high CO₂ pressure is expensive and therefore limits the market for this method. However, food industry segments that process high-value products such as dried fruits, drugs, and spices have been taking advantage of this MA method (Adler et al, 2000; Nakakita et al, 2001; Prozell and Reichmuth, 2001; Riudavets et al, 2003). More research is needed to obtain additional biological data on storage pests.

**TABLE 6**

**Suggested Provisional Dosage Regimes for Control of All Stages of the 12 Most Common Insect Species of Stored Grain, Using Modified Atmospheres at Temperatures Between 20 and 29°C**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atmospheric Gas Concentration</th>
<th>Controls Most Common Grain Insects Including <em>Trogoderma granarium</em></th>
<th>Exposure Period (days)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1% O₂ (in nitrogen)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant % CO₂ in air</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO₂ decay in air from &gt;70 to 35%</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pressurized CO₂ at &gt;20 bar</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>&lt;0.35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Source: Navarro and Donahaye (1990); used by permission.

b Data, except those on pressurized CO₂, compiled from Annis (1987).
Rate of supply. Because of the relatively long exposure time involved, one basic concept of MA application methods is the combination of two separate phases: an initial “purge” for the establishment of the desired atmospheric gas composition and a subsequent “maintenance” phase, in which the desired gas composition is maintained during the exposure period (Banks and Annis, 1977). This concept differs from the “single-shot” treatment suggested by Banks et al (1980). The single treatment is suitable for CO₂ when an initial concentration higher than 70% is established and the gastightness of the structure is sufficient to allow maintenance of a concentration above 35% for at least 10 days.

MA treatment must displace a large volume of the intergranular free space plus the headspace of the silo. The rate of gas supply is purely an economic aspect of the application of MAs, since a substantial portion of the expense involved consists of the cost of transporting the liquid CO₂ or N₂ and of the on-site purging, which is a time-consuming process (Guiffre and Segal, 1984). If on-site bulk gas tanks are not installed, truck demurrage charges must be added. With gas burners, the aspect of transportation is less critical, since the quantities of hydrocarbon gas used are considerably less.

The gas supply rates required for the application of selected MAs are listed in Table 7. The proposed supply time at “purge” phase for an MA of <1% O₂ is considerably shorter than for the other MAs applied at normal atmospheric pressure. This shorter purge time derives from the physical characteristics of N₂ (Banks and Annis, 1977). A method (not included in Table 7) that has been used by the present author in small bins of 50-t capacity consists of direct gas supply to the bin in a liquid state, thereby reducing the supply time considerably. This method is discussed in the section on gas supply in a liquid state.

The shortest supply time is achievable using a pressurized CO₂ system (Table 7). The natural pressure of liquid CO₂ is advantageous in creating high pressure in the exposure chamber.

### Table 7: Rate of Gas Supply Requirements for Modified Atmosphere Application

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atmospheric Gas Concentration</th>
<th>Application Phase</th>
<th>Amount of Gas per Commodity</th>
<th>Supply Time (hr)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;1% O₂ in N₂</td>
<td>Purge</td>
<td>1–2 m³ N₂</td>
<td>&lt;12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td>0.01–0.06 m³ N₂</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;70% CO₂ in air</td>
<td>Purge</td>
<td>0.5–1.9 m³ CO₂</td>
<td>&lt;48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td>0.02–0.04 m³ CO₂</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas burner &lt;1% O₂</td>
<td>Purge</td>
<td>17–66 g C₃H₈</td>
<td>&lt;48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With &gt;14% CO₂</td>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td>0.6–1.2 g C₃H₈</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;70% CO₂ in air</td>
<td>Single-shot</td>
<td>0.5–1.0 m³ CO₂</td>
<td>&lt;48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pressurized CO₂ at &gt;20 bar</td>
<td>Single-shot</td>
<td>&gt;18 kg CO₂</td>
<td>&lt;0.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Source: Navarro and Donahaye (1990); used by permission.
b Compiled from Banks (1984a) (except data on pressurized CO₂). Only gas compositions supported by field experience are presented in this table. The basic assumptions for the above requirements are that the storage is filled with grain (minimum headspace) and that pressure decay time is >35 min for decay from 500 to 250 Pa.
c According to the dosage regime; see also Table 6.

d Structural requirements. Storage structures designed specifically for the application of MAs are practically nonexistent, apart from those in Australia (Ripp et al, 1984). Banks and Ripp (1984) noted an increasing trend in Australia toward the use of sealed storage for dry grain, accompanied by the conversion of existing structures to sealed storage rather than construction of new installations. Large-scale application of sealed storage by the food industry has recently received attention because of the approaching phase-out of methyl bromide (Casada and Noyes, 2001; UNEP, 2002). Therefore, before deciding on the method of MA application, careful examination should be made of sealing requirements to obtain a standard acceptable for maintaining the gas composition over the designed exposure period (Banks, 1984b; Navarro, 1997a, 1999; Casada and Noyes, 2001; Navarro and Zettler, 2001). For application of pressurized CO₂, specially designed chambers and installations to withstand the high pressures are needed (Prozell and Reichmuth, 2001).

Application of MA in a gaseous state. For application of N₂ or CO₂ into upright storages, simple inlet systems fitted into the bin wall can be used for gas introduction. The design of the system should be such as to prevent excessive pressure buildup over weak areas of the silo bin wall, especially around the inlet pipe. For purge rates of 6 m³/min, an inlet pipe with an 8-cm diameter has proven convenient (Banks and Annis, 1980). However, in bins equipped with a grain aeration system, it is advantageous to use the inlet duct system as the gas introduction point to obtain improved purging efficiency.

When purging upward, high CO₂ levels tend to remain in the lower layers of large bins, which may result in uneven and sometimes inadequate CO₂ concentrations for insect control, especially in the upper layers of bins (Wilson et al, 1980). To overcome this, especially in the single-shot CO₂ application method, where no maintenance phase is used, it is important to introduce an air injector into the CO₂ stream, so as to produce a CO₂-air premix at the designed concentration, or to recirculate the CO₂-air mixture until the desired CO₂ concentration is attained in all regions of the bin (Navarro et al, 1986).

For the application of CO₂, Jay (1971, 1980) proposed three methods. These, together with the recirculation and blending methods (Navarro et al, 1979; Wilson et al, 1984) compose the five basic application methods suitable for MAs at normal atmospheric pressure. They are summarized in Table 8 and presented schematically in Figure 12. Recirculation gives the most uniform concentration, and it can be applied by moving the gases inside the bins upward or downward (Navarro et al, 1986). The main gain in using downward flow is with application by burner gas. It takes advantage of the long path of the external gas delivery pipe to cool and thereby dehumidify the hot gases after the burner (Navarro et al, 1979). The pressurized CO₂ method is most advantageous when an extremely short exposure time is a condition (Gerard et al, 1988b) (Table 8, method 6).

Application of MA in liquid or solid state. For small silos and MA treatment chambers of up to 100 m³, a direct supply of CO₂ from cylinders equipped with a siphon was tested by Navarro and Donahaye (1990). By this means, CO₂ is released in a liquid state from the pressurized cylinder.
### TABLE 8
Methods of Application of Modified Atmospheres

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methods of Application</th>
<th>Applicable Modified Atmosphere</th>
<th>Main Advantages</th>
<th>Main Disadvantages</th>
<th>References&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Purge full silo from the top</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>Requires only one application. Labor requirements are minimal.</td>
<td>Purging time is long. Some CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; is lost in outflow with air mix.</td>
<td>4,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Apply CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; in the grain stream (snow, dry ice)</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>Method is fast. No vaporization equipment is needed.</td>
<td>Danger of explosion (static electricity). Constant supervision during application.</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Lift the atmosphere out (air displacement method). Continuous purge from bottom</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;, N&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;, GB&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Labor requirements are low. No loss of gas in mixing. Works best with N&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;.</td>
<td>Gas purging region of silo should be leak-free. With CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; it creates high localized concentration so blending may be necessary.</td>
<td>1,2,4,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Blending and purging</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>Homogenous concentration is obtained. No loss of gas in mixing.</td>
<td>Air CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; mixing equipment is necessary.</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recirculation</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;, GB</td>
<td>Homogenous concentration is obtained. No loss of gas in mixing.</td>
<td>Recirculation equipment is necessary.</td>
<td>6,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Pressurized CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt; at &gt;20 bar</td>
<td>CO&lt;sub&gt;2&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>Short exposure time required for complete control.</td>
<td>Method is costly and needs special exposure chamber.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup> Source: Navarro and Donahaye (1990); used by permission.

<sup>b</sup> 1 = Banks and Annis (1977); 2 = Fleurat Lessard and Le Torc’h (1987); 3 = Gerard et al (1988b); 4 = Jay (1980); 5 = Jay and Pearman (1973); 6 = Navarro et al (1979); 7 = Storey (1973); 8 = Wilson et al (1984).

<sup>c</sup> GB = Gas-burner atmosphere, consisting of <1% O<sub>2</sub>, 15% CO<sub>2</sub>, and 84% N<sub>2</sub>.

---

![Fig. 12. Four methods of applying a modified atmosphere.](Image)
A large volume of CO₂ can thus be introduced into the treated enclosure in a relatively short time, thereby causing displacement by lift-out of a substantial portion of the atmosphere from the free space of the treated structure. Great care should therefore be taken to install a large enough vent pipe and to ensure that the structure can withstand the pressure buildup at the initial purging phase. In addition, it is strongly recommended that the pressure of the treated structure be monitored. Experience with this method of gas supply has shown that, at a rate of 4 m³ of CO₂ per minute, the pressure buildup within a chamber of 110 m³ was less than 60 Pa when the vent pipe’s internal diameter was 75 mm (Navarro et al, 1998b).

Application of CO₂ in the form of dry ice to control insects infesting flour in hopper cars (Ronai and Jay, 1982) and in freight containers (Sharp and Banks, 1980) was investigated.

Hermetic Storage, Sealed Storage, and Airtight Storage

Factors affecting insect mortality in hermetic storage.
The important role of low O₂ concentration, rather than high CO₂, in causing mortality of stored-product insects in hermetic storage was demonstrated by Bailey (1955, 1956, 1957, 1965). Only later was the importance of the synergistic effect of concomitant O₂ depletion and CO₂ accumulation for insect control clearly demonstrated (Calderon and Navarro, 1979, 1980; Donahaye et al, 1996). These synergistic and combined effects are essential for successful insect control, as shown by studies of the effects of incomplete airtightness upon insect populations (Oxley and Wickenden, 1963; Burrell, 1968). To demonstrate the effects of incomplete airtightness, Navarro et al (1994) modeled a fixed O₂ ingress rate equivalent to about 0.24% per day for a structure with a volume of 10 m³. For these given values, changes in oxygen concentrations in response to different initial insect populations are illustrated in Figure 13. Accordingly, a cyclic change in concentrations is obtained as a result of O₂ ingress and the ability of insects to survive at low O₂ levels. These theoretical cyclic changes in O₂ concentrations are also observed in different laboratory and field studies (Navarro et al, 1984, 1994).

The influence of temperature on insect respiration implies that, in warm climates, O₂ intake by insects is very intensive. Conversely, in temperate climates, insect metabolism is much slower; depletion of O₂ may be lower than its ingress; and insect control may not be achieved. This led Burrell (1980) to postulate that, for light infestations of cool grain, residual populations would provide an inoculum for reinestation after the grain is removed from hermetic storage.

Modern hermetic storage. In aboveground rigid structures. Documented data on successful application of hermetic storage to aboveground constructions are largely lacking. Many existing silos and warehouses have been modified to provide a high degree of hermetic seal, especially in Australia (Delmenico, 1993). However, the objectives have been to convert these storages for MA treatments or improved fumigations and not for hermetic storage as such.

In contrast, the sealing of both bagged stacks and bulk grain in warehouses in China using plastic liners is part of a grain preservation regime termed “triple-low.” This is an integrated approach to insect control consisting of obtaining reduced O₂ concentrations by metabolic activity within the grain bulk in combination with phosphine and low-temperature treatments (Wang et al, 1993; Xu and Wang, 1993). This procedure is claimed to provide effective protection.

In aboveground flexible structures. In the early 1970s, aboveground structures were designed in England for emergency storage using flexible plastic liners supported by a weld-mesh frame. These liners were made of butyl rubber, sometimes laminated with white ethylene-propylene-diene monomer, and consisted either of a wall-floor section, plus a roof section attached after loading, or both sections welded into a single unit. These silos were recommended for both conventional storage and hermetic storage of dry grain (Kenneford and O’Dowd, 1981). However, in tropical and subtropical climates, the liners were found to deteriorate, and gas permeability increased to a level at which the liners could no longer be used for hermetic storage (Navarro and Donahaye, 1976; O’Dowd and Kenneford, 1983).

In Israel, the manufacture of PVC liners that conform to prerequisite specifications of durability to climate, gas permeability, and physical properties has enabled the development of three storage systems based on the hermetic principle. These are 1) bunker storage for conservation of large bulks of 10,000–15,000 t (Navarro et al, 1984, 1993); 2) flexible silos supported by a weld-mesh frame of 50- to 1,000-t capacity for storage of grain in bulk or in bags (Calderon et al, 1989; Navarro et al, 1990); and 3) liners for enclosing stacks of 10- to 50-t capacity (termed “storage cubes”) designed for storage at the farmer-cooperative and small-trader level (Donahaye et al, 1991b; Rindner et al, 2002). These structures are in current use for capacities of up to 300 t for bagged storage of cereals.

The problem of applying present-day technology to provide hermetic storage for subsistence farmers lies in the need to provide an easily sealable low-cost container with a capacity of 50–100 kg. The high ratio of surface area to volume necessitates a liner with very low permeability to

![Fig. 13. Calculated oxygen concentrations in a 10-m³ grain mass containing different infestation levels of insects and having an oxygen intake of 157 µL per insect per day, using a sealed liner with an oxygen ingress rate of 0.24% per day. (Redrawn, and used with permission, from Navarro et al, 1994)](image-url)
gases. The most recent attempt to address this problem has been through the “Joseph bag,” which is made of a plastic-metal foil laminate, sealable by means of a hot iron (Murray, 1990).

**In underground flexible structures.** The main approach to achieving lower levels of O₂ and higher accumulations of CO₂ has been by lining pits with plastic liners to improve the hermetic seal (Donahaye et al, 1967; Dunkel et al, 1987). With a similar approach, small-scale underground storages have been developed for farmer storage of corn and dry beans in Brazil (Sartori and Costa, 1975; Sartori, 1987).

**Experience gained using flexible liners.** The accumulated experience with hermetic storage using several types of flexible liners for aboveground storage and in-the-open storage, under tropical and subtropical conditions (Navarro et al., 1968, 1984, 1990, 1993; Calderon et al., 1989; Donahaye et al., 1991b; Navarro and Donahaye, 1993a; Silberstein et al., 1998) is summarized in the following observations.

**Structural durability.** The use of PVC-based sheeting without mesh reinforcement produces a material of suitable strength and elasticity for storing grain. This material was formulated to have a high resistance to solar UV irradiation. Rodent penetration has been recorded on only exceptional occasions involving minor damage. The hypothesis that rodents find it difficult to gain a foothold on the smooth surface has been corroborated by laboratory studies using wild-caught roof rats and house mice (S. Navarro, S. Moran, R. Dias, and E. Donahaye, unpublished data).

Liners have been used continuously for over 10 years, and although they have lost some plasticity, permeability to gases decreases as the plasticizers evaporate. This characteristic renders the liners more effective in retaining gas concentrations with time, e.g., for 0.83-mm PVC, the initial permeability (expressed throughout as a measure given at a gradient from 21% O₂) decreased from 87 to 50 mL of O₂ per square meter per day after four years of exposure under a Mediterranean climate (S. Navarro, E. Donahaye, and A. Azrieli, unpublished data).

**Insect control.** At a liner thickness of 0.83 mm and an O₂ permeability level of 87 mL/m² per day, there is a possibility of insect survival close to the grain-liner interface. This is especially so at the top layer of the structures, where moisture content tends to be higher than in the remaining parts of the bulk. However, after the minimum O₂ concentration is reached, survival is usually well below one insect per kilogram and multiple samplings would be required to detect a single insect (Navarro et al., 1984, 1993). This residual infestation is more of a problem on return to aerobic conditions, so the commodity should be consumed without additional prolonged storage. The residual infestation is less serious than the danger of reinfection by insects from the surroundings under storage by conventional methods. For grain destined for export and in other cases in which freedom from insects is mandatory, a final treatment using phosphine may be undertaken if necessary. In the future, this treatment may be superfluous if higher degrees of gas retention achieve complete elimination of residual infestation.

**Moisture migration.** Diurnal temperature fluctuations, accentuated by solar radiation on liners, followed by rapid cooling at night, cause successive moistening and drying cycles at the upper grain surface. This may result in gradual moisture accumulation, particularly during the transient seasons between summer and winter when temperature fluctuations are greatest, so that initially dry grain may rise above critical moisture levels, enabling limited microfloral spoilage to occur. This is particularly likely along the peaks of bunkers, where warm air rising on convection currents tends to concentrate the moisture condensation in confined areas. For bunkers with a capacity of 12,000–15,000 t and constructed in recent years, the condensation phenomenon has been alleviated and almost eliminated by leveling the peaked top (with a ridge of less than 2 m) to a slightly convex, wide apex of bunker cross section (with a ridge of more than 6 m) that is just sufficient to permit rainwater runoff. This configuration appears to enable the dispersal of moisture migration over a much larger area. Differences in the intensity of moisture increase have been demonstrated between bunkers with narrow ridges and peaked tops, and bunkers with tops having a broad ridge (Silberstein et al., 1998). Although comparative results for concurrent storages are not available, these results come from observations made over four intermittent years at the same storage site in Israel (Navarro et al., 1994).

For dry grain kept in “storage cubes” in subtropical climates, moisture migration is not a pronounced phenomenon. However, for corn or paddy stored in the tropics, moisture migration is intensified because the initial grain moisture is closer to its critical level. For this purpose, placement of an insulating layer between the liner and the upper layer of bagged grain provides a limited solution to moisture migration. This consists of a layer of bagged agricultural wastes, such as rice hulls, or straw; if these are not available, a “felt-fiber” layer with insulating properties is appropriate. This method suffers from several disadvantages. An alternative method of insulating the stack from diurnal temperature fluctuations was investigated. It consists of using a shade screen formed from aluminum-coated high-density polyethylene threads. After five months of storage, no perceptible increase in moisture content was found at the top of the stack, and the grain remained in good condition (Donahaye et al, 2000).

**Hermetic storage as a future alternative.** The need for alternative methods of prevention and control of insect infestations in stored products has become acute over the last few years. This is because conventional measures using insecticides are being questioned by environmental agencies and pressure groups, and the choice of available permissible materials is decreasing. Two fumigants remain in general use. However, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency has made the decision to phase out methyl bromide by the year 2005 due to its destructive effect on ozone in the stratosphere (UNEP, 2002). This is coupled with mounting evidence of the development of insect resistance to phosphine (Zettler, 1993), indicating that even phosphine may not be economically effective in years to come. Modern and safer acceptable technologies such as aeration, refrigerated aeration, and MAs are still expensive and require adequate infrastructure. In sharp contrast to the use
of chemicals, hermetic storage is an environmentally friendly technology, involving no hazard to the storage operators, consumers, or nontarget organisms, and as such, its application should enjoy a high level of consumer acceptance.

In developing countries. Hermetic storage may provide an answer to the need for a less costly method of secure food storage for rural populations (McFarlane, 1970; Navarro et al, 1999, 2000). This could be achieved by supplying a storage solution at the farmer level, thereby affording the farmer protection from seasonal fluctuations in grain prices. The basic advantage of hermetic storage in developing countries is its simplicity, obviating the need for insecticidal mixing procedures or fumigations, both of which require high levels of expertise not usually possessed by the small-scale farmer (Pattinson, 1970; Sakho, 1971). Furthermore, it is generally the only MA option since MA generators or gas cylinders are neither affordable nor obtainable.

In technologically advanced countries. In spite of the trend toward improved sealing of existing silos in some countries (Newman, 1990; Delmenico, 1993), the objective has been either to obtain increased fumigation efficiency or to convert structures for storage under MAs. The relatively slow rates of O₂ depletion in the hermetic-storage process, especially when the initial insect population is low, render it infeasible to apply this method to short-term storage systems. Also it is not practical for application in rigid horizontal storage structures, where the headspace is always relatively large. Clearly, hermetic storage is best applied to long-term storage projects, such as national grain reserves, buffer stocks, and grain surpluses.

The conversion of rigid structures to sealed storages should be considered for long-term large-scale storage projects. The evidence that this method is most effective at the high temperatures prevailing in tropical climates is best documented by De Lima (1990). In such climates, aeration for cooling of grain is not feasible; reinfestation is frequent; and the available contact insecticides degrade rapidly because of the high temperatures. Under these conditions, hermetic storage may provide an advantageous solution.

High-Pressure Carbon Dioxide Treatment (HPCT)

Carbon dioxide as a fumigant remains slower-acting than phosphine or methyl bromide. The stored-product pests laboratories at Bordeaux and Berlin investigated the use of carbon dioxide at high pressure (Fleurat-Lessard, 1990; Reichmuth and Wohlgemuth, 1994). After extensive testing in the laboratory, a high-pressure fumigation chamber was designed and built in collaboration with the French company MG SIAC. The chamber can hold the equivalent of the contents of one transport trailer. The unit is designed to recover at least 85% of the carbon dioxide used. The pressure rises to 19 atm in 90 min, is held there for 60 min, and takes about 30 min to be released. With loading, fumigation, and unloading, a full cycle takes approximately 4 hr.

The treatment requirements include pressure-proof autoclaves and gas-permeable packaging material for bags and boxes. The product to be treated is left in its original packaging and is transported on pallets into the autoclave. Liquid carbon dioxide is vaporized via a heat-exchange unit, introduced into the autoclave in gaseous form, and raised to the treatment pressure. After the treatment period, about 2 hr at 20 bar, the release of carbon dioxide follows, and the pressure drops back to ambient atmospheric pressure. The gas is exhausted into the atmosphere in a short time (10–15 min) with the use of a silencer, to avoid a loud noise during release. The rate of decompression of pressurized storages may also have an adverse impact on insect mortality (Ulrichs, 1994; Ulrichs, et al 1997a,b).

Gerard, et al (1990) described a high-pressure chamber (CARVEX) connected to a tank of liquid CO₂ placed on a balance (Fig. 14). This unit is commercially available and utilized in Germany.

Low-Pressure Vacuum Hermetic Fumigation

Finkelman et al (2002a, 2003a) reported on the introduction of flexible, transportable sealed chambers made of welded PVC liners that have opened new opportunities to implement low pressures (vacuum treatment) as a competitive and affordable treatment to control storage-insect pests. Under vacuum, these chambers shrink over the periphery of the commodity and hold it fast. The system is sealed by an airtight zipper and is able to retain the vacuum (Fig. 15). At the base of the chamber, an inlet hose enables connection to the vacuum pump that creates the prerequisite low pressure (Fig. 16).

Finkelman et al (2002a) showed that attempting to hold a pressure below 45 mm of Hg is not a practical approach because of the energy required for prolonged operation of

---

Fig. 14. Pressure chamber of about 3 m³ designed to hold CO₂ at 20 and 37 bar, liquid CO₂ supply tank, and regulator unit. (Reprinted, with permission, from Gerard et al (1990))

Fig. 15. Two vacuum hermetic fumigation cocoons under a pressure of 50 mm of Hg (three days of exposure on the right and seven days on the left) connected together to the pump at the trial site in Israel. (Reprinted, with permission, from Navarro et al, 2003a)
the pump. Conversely, pressures above 55 mm of Hg prolong the time to achieve kill. In contrast to fumigations, for which schedules are provided by defining dosages to be applied for a predetermined time, low-pressure treatment schedules, for treatment at a set temperature range, must be presented as exposure times at both a temperature range and a relative humidity level in equilibrium with the commodity moisture content.

**Tested commodities.** Ten durable commodities (corn, corn chips, cocoa, garden peas, chick peas, wheat, wheat flour, rice, sunflower seeds, and semolina) were exposed to five days of vacuum treatment (Finkelman et al, 2003a,c). The commodities were packed in different ways. Commodities such as corn, garden peas, chick peas, and sunflower seeds were stored in big bags of 1-t capacity. Wheat, rice, and semolina were stored in 50-kg bags, and corn chips and wheat flour were stored in 25-kg bags loaded on wooden pallets. The temperatures of the stored commodities ranged from 26 to 33°C, and relative humidities ranged from 35 to 50%. In all tested commodities, the treated product was well preserved, and in cases where initial infestation was detected, complete mortality of insects was observed.

The advantage of this treatment is that no toxic chemicals are employed. Exposure times to provide kill are comparable to those of phosphine, and the exposure time of five days falls within a range suitable for quarantine treatments when rapid treatment is not essential. If the commodity can be placed in flexible liners and packed in a manner that can withstand the low pressure, vacuum treatment can provide a good solution (Navarro et al, 2001a, 2003a). As for fumigation, treatment schedules must be developed for low-pressure treatments by establishing a database on the relative susceptibilities of the different insect species (at all their stages) that are liable to infest the commodity.

**Fumigants and MA**

Carmi et al (1991), Leesch (1991), and Mueller (1994) suggested the use of phosphine and carbon dioxide together for stored-product protection. This combined use provides quick and even distribution of phosphine throughout large grain bulks and possibly other products, without additional mechanical circulation. Desmarchelier (1984) and Desmarchelier and Wohlgemuth (1984) demonstrated that this combination is not synergistic. The pupae of *S. granarius* require the same amount of phosphine irrespective of whether phosphine is presented alone or in a mixture. The developmental stages of insects (eggs and pupae) consume very little oxygen and appear to be little affected by the combined action of phosphine and carbon dioxide.

**Sealing and Pressure Test for Gastightness**

A fundamental requirement for the successful application of gaseous treatments to control stored-product insects is a well-sealed structure. In the sealed structure, the desired gas concentration should be maintained at a level sufficient to control insects; otherwise, the gas concentration would decrease rapidly without having an effect. The requirement for gastight storages for application of CAs and MAAs appears to be more critical than for application of fumigants (Bond, 1984). In spite of the trend toward improved sealing of existing silos in some countries (Newman, 1990; Delmeneico, 1993), the objective has been either to obtain increased fumigation efficiency or to convert structures for storage under CAs.

Fumigants have been used for many years with limited requirements for structural tightness, and covering the grain bulk or the storage with plastic sheets was usually considered satisfactory. Gastightness has for years been a problem for the application of fumigants in storage. The consequences of poorly sealed storages under fumigation should be considered in view of the development of insect resistance to fumigants in poorly sealed structures (Banks and Desmarchelier, 1979; Banks, 1984b; Zettler, 1993, 1997).

Methods to determine gastightness have been investigated for different purposes. In the analysis of energy requirements of buildings, air infiltration is known to be a primary source of energy loss, and this infiltration can be measured experimentally. CO₂ has also been used experimentally as a tracer gas (Navarro, 1997a). Hunt (1980) reviewed some tracer-gas techniques to measure air infiltration into buildings and compared fan-pressurization-evacuation procedures to estimate the comparative tightness of those structures. The dynamic characteristics of air infiltration into buildings have been studied to predict the heating and cooling load of seasonal energy requirements (Hill and Kusuda, 1975). The *Handbook of Fundamentals* of the American Society of Heating, Refrigeration, and Air-Conditioning Engineers describes the air-change method and the crack method in predicting air infiltration rates (Anonymous, 1972). The crack method, or the constant-pressure test, is usually regarded as more accurate as long as the leak characteristics can be evaluated properly (Hill and Kusuda, 1975). With this method, airflow is expressed as:

\[ Q = b \times \Delta P^n \]

where \( Q \) = the volumetric flow rate of air, \( b \) = the proportionate constant, \( n \) = the exponent, and \( \Delta P \) = the pressure difference exerted on an enclosure.

Meiering (1982) investigated a constant-pressure test and a variable-pressure test for measuring specific silo permeability in silage systems, where the sealed shell was designed to limit entry of O₂ to minimize losses in quality. The effect of variations in environmental temperature and atmospheric pressure on O₂ intake of silos was simulated.

---

![Vacuum hose connected to the tube](image)
and the permeability limits required for proper O₂ control in silos containing silage were defined. Gas interchange within freight containers and factors leading to gas interchange between containers and the external atmosphere were detailed by Banks et al (1975). They found that the relationship between applied pressure and gas leak rate gave a useful measure of gas tightness. Banks and Annis (1977) developed a practical guide for storage of dry grain under MA and specified requirements for silo gas tightness. Their specifications correspond to the pressure-decay times needed to maintain the atmospheric composition in the silos. Sharp (1982), using the constant-pressure test, measured the gas tight level of sealed structures. These tests are designed to estimate the permissible limits for effectively maintaining the gas composition in the storages during the treatment.

Gas Permeation Through the Rigid Structural Membrane

Gas loss through the structural membrane during gaseous treatments is an important phenomenon. Membranes of concrete, plaster, and plastic permit gas permeation and gas exchange. Pressure tests, as described below, are not capable of measuring the degree of such losses.

Comparative Results with the Variable-Pressure Test

In the variable-pressure test, the structure is pressurized to a value above atmospheric, using a fan. The air supply is then shut off, and the pressure is allowed to fall by natural leakage to a new value. The time taken to fall from the high (positive or negative) pressure serves as a measure of the degree of sealing. Time elapse to half the pressure is usually considered for comparisons of gas tightness level. A constant-static-pressure test is more accurate than a variable-pressure-decay test and has the advantage of being independent of bin volume. However, the variable-pressure-decay test is quicker and therefore the most practical means of measuring gas tightness in grain storage (Zabradnik, 1968; Annis and van S. Graver, 1991; Ball and van S. Graver, 1997; Navarro, 1997a; Navarro and Zettler, 2001).

To minimize the thermal influence, tests should be carried out preferably before sunrise and in still weather. A pressure of 250 Pa may be taken as an upper limit, but for some structures, even this pressure may cause poor seals to open. Welded steel cells and concrete silos may be able to stand 500 Pa, but higher pressures are usually unnecessary.

Comparisons of variable-pressure tests are scarce. Table 9 was prepared to provide provisional guidelines based on the best estimates available in the literature. The suggested times given in Table 9 were doubled for empty storages as an approximation of the intergranular airspace, since for barley, corn, rough rice, and wheat, this free space is in the range of 35–65% of the total volume (Trisviaskii, 1966).

For CA storage in Australia, with structures of 300- to 10,000-t capacity; a decay time of 5 min for an excess pressure drop from 2,500 to 1,500 Pa or from 1,500 to 750 Pa or from 500 to 250 Pa was regarded as satisfactory (Banks et al., 1980). According to Banks and Annis (1980), this range of pressures was chosen so that it would be the highest usable without unduly stressing the storage fabric of the store. They commented also that above 10,000-t capacity, pressure testing is difficult to carry out satisfactorily since it requires very stable atmospheric conditions. Analysis of the data presented by Banks et al. (1980) suggests that, for storages with capacities in the range of 1,600–1,900 t in CAs with an initial CO₂ concentration of about 60–85% for an average decay time of 11 min, the daily decay rate was about 4% CO₂. With a similar range of initial CO₂ concentration in a structure of 150-m³ capacity, daily gas loss was correlated with different levels of pressure-decay times (Navarro et al., 1998b). Their comparison resulted in a pressure-decay time of 3 min for a daily decay rate of about 4% CO₂.

The influence of hermetic storage on controlling insects was examined using small-scale sealed plastic structures with capacities of 15, 30, and 52 m³ for outdoor storage of wheat, paddy, and corn (Navarro and Caliboso, 1996). Pressure-decay rates were compared with daily CO₂ decay rates. With these structures, successful insect controls were obtained with a daily decay rate of >1% CO₂, which was found to be equivalent to a 5-min half-life pressure-decay time. Similarly comparative data was obtained using hermetic bunker storages of about 19,000-m³ capacity, where successful results were obtained when the half-life pressure decay was about 9 min (Navarro et al., 1984).

According to Banks and Annis (1984), daily ventilation rates tolerable in various insect-control processes are estimated as 2.6% for hermetic storage, 5% for N₂-based CA, 7% for CO₂-based CA, and 10% for phosphine fumigation. Based on the proportions of ventilation rates, this would account for the ventilation rates for fumigation using phosphine being twice those of N₂-based CA, and the latter being about twice those of hermetic storage. These values were also considered in extrapolating the different ranges given in Table 9.

Constant-Pressure Tests

For the constant-pressure test, a fan, a valve, hosing, a pressure sensor, and a gas flowmeter (e.g., a Rotameter) is required. The required capacity of the flowmeter varies with the size of the enclosure under test. It is often convenient to make up a series (battery) of flowmeters, which

---

**Table 9**

Provisional Recommended Ranges for the Variable-Pressure Test in Structures Destined for Gaseous Treatments to Control Storage Insects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Gaseous Treatment</th>
<th>Structure Volume (m³)</th>
<th>Variable-Pressure Test Decay Time (min from 250 to 125 Pa)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fumigants</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Empty Structure</td>
<td>95% Full</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500-2,000</td>
<td>4 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2,000-5,000</td>
<td>6 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Controlled atmosphere</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Empty Structure</td>
<td>95% Full</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500-2,000</td>
<td>7 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2,000-15,000</td>
<td>11 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modified atmosphere,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>including airtight storage</td>
<td>Empty Structure</td>
<td>95% Full</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500-2,000</td>
<td>12 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2,000-15,000</td>
<td>18 9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Source: Navarro (1999); used by permission.
allows a range of flow measurements from 0.005 to 3 m<sup>3</sup>/min, to accommodate widely varying requirements and give a wide range of test flows. Alternatively, an electronic thermoanemometer type of flowmeter to cover a wide range of flows may be used. An adjustable rheostat (e.g., Variac) is useful for regulating the speed of the fan if it has a brush motor.

In experimental laboratory work carried out by Navarro (1997a), a 665.7-L silo was used to demonstrate the dependence of the empirical parameter (n) values on orifice length. In a grain bin or silo, this orifice length may constitute the thickness of the wall. Accordingly, the longer the orifice was, the higher the value of n was. Based on experimental observations, it was also demonstrated that synoptic variations in barometric pressure played a significant role in air infiltration into the experimental silo. During the experiments, synoptic variations in barometric pressure ranging between 11 and 17 Pa/hr were observed in the test room. The measured CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations were compared with the calculated values based on equations that took into consideration initial CO<sub>2</sub> adsorption by the wheat, diffusion of CO<sub>2</sub> through the leak, and variations in temperature and barometric pressure. Under experimental conditions, close agreement between the measured and calculated values was obtained.

In view of the work involved in determining the n value, a rather simplified expression of using the airflow to maintain a constant pressure may be proposed as an alternative. With a similar approach, Banks et al (1975) used the flow rate at a constant pressure of 125 Pa to correlate with the daily gas-interchange rate in freight containers. Such comparative results with constant-pressure tests for larger structures and for different gaseous treatments are needed. Until such information is obtained, the provisional decay times for the variable-pressure test given in Table 9 may serve as guidelines for determining the suitability of specific storage structures for the successful gaseous control of storage insects.

**Monitoring Gas Concentrations**

Monitoring is the process of measuring the MA gas concentration inside a treated enclosure and in the area surrounding it.

Monitoring is done for two reasons: to be sure that workers and people near the MA-treated site are safe and there is no health hazard, and to measure the concentration and distribution of MA gas inside the enclosure to ensure the success of the MA.

**Monitoring Equipment**

A wide variety of equipment is available for measuring oxygen and carbon dioxide concentrations. The equipment used should be suitable for monitoring in 1) the concentration ranges involved in the workplace and 2) the insecticidal concentrations reached during MA treatments.

Instruments for monitoring are available that can measure oxygen and carbon dioxide gases at 1) low concentrations only—for workplace safety (threshold limit value) measurements, 2) high concentrations only—for checking the progress of MA exposures, and 3) low and high concentrations, from the low safety concentrations to the high insecticidal concentrations.

The range of instruments available extends from single-use gas detector tubes (for use either at safety or fumigation concentrations) to multipurpose electronic instruments.

**Measuring Gas Concentrations in the Health and Safety Range**

High-CO<sub>2</sub> and/or low-O<sub>2</sub> atmospheres can present safety hazards when used improperly. Humans exposed to such MAs can recover completely if removed quickly from the exposure and assisted in recovery. A concentration of 5% CO<sub>2</sub> is sufficient for persons to respond to the unpleasant atmosphere, whereas CO<sub>2</sub>-free and O<sub>2</sub>-deficient atmospheres with an O<sub>2</sub> concentration lower than 14% have no warning effects and cause unconsciousness.

The workspace around the treated enclosure should always be well ventilated to avoid accumulation of a high-CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere because of the density and tendency of high concentrations of CO<sub>2</sub> to accumulate in lower areas of the enclosed regions around the treated enclosure. A potential safety hazard exists when using high-CO<sub>2</sub> atmospheres, particularly in leaky enclosures. High concentrations of N<sub>2</sub> to produce low-O<sub>2</sub> atmospheres are unlikely to present a similar type of hazard because they have a density similar to that of air.

**SPECIFIC APPLICATIONS OF MA**

**Cereal-Grain Preservation**

The pioneering research of recent modern times first concentrated on the possible application of MA technology to cereal grains (Jay, 1984a; Banks and Annis, 1990; Navarro et al, 1990; Adler et al, 2000). Work related to the preservation of cereal grains is also well documented by Calderon and Barkai-Golan (1990).

Jay and Pearman (1973) controlled a natural infestation of the rice weevil complex and the Angoumois grain moth, *Sitotroga cerealella*, in 28,000 bu of corn in an upright concrete silo. In this test, a CO<sub>2</sub> concentration of about 60% (the balance was air) was successfully attained and maintained over a 96-hr period. Jay (1971) also published suggestions on how to use CO<sub>2</sub> to control insects in grain-storage facilities.

Australia began large-scale field tests with CO<sub>2</sub> in 1976 (Banks, 1979). In the first test, gaseous CO<sub>2</sub> was released at three points into the base of a 7,000-t welded metal bin containing wheat, and the pressure of the CO<sub>2</sub> eventually pushed the existing atmosphere out of the top of the bin. A second test was conducted in a similar manner except that an air pump was used to blend air with the CO<sub>2</sub>. Thus, instead of a 100% concentration going into the bin, a 70% concentration was released, thereby saving CO<sub>2</sub>. Since these tests, Australian researchers have conducted additional studies on large grain-storage facilities, including the sealing and subsequent treatment of a 16,000-t flat storage with CO<sub>2</sub> (Banks et al, 1979).

Interest in the use of N<sub>2</sub> for controlling stored-product insects began in Australia in the early 1970s and continued through 1976. These studies and Australian recommenda-
tions for the use of \( \text{N}_2 \) in grain storage are described by Banks and Annis (1990). Also, considerable research was conducted in Italy on the use of \( \text{N}_2 \) for long-term grain storage. This research lead to the development (by Assoreni, a member of the ENI [Italian Hydrocarbon National Concern] group of companies for scientific research) of a total marketable system that included metal silos, conveyors, and equipment for applying \( \text{N}_2 \) as well as the \( \text{N}_2 \) itself (Tranchino et al, 1980).

**Preservation of Tree Nuts and Dried Fruits**

The possibility of applying MAs for controlling insects in dried fruits and tree nuts has been reviewed by Soderstrom and Brandl (1984, 1990). Accordingly, the major volume treated with MAs consists of finished, packaged product. Bulk storages require extensive sealing before an MA can be applied, and the industry considers the process too slow and costly in comparison with other control methods. An effort is now being made to make the equipment for producing MAs more efficient and to improve the methods of sealing storages.

Jay et al (1970) were the first to attain and maintain effective \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentrations for two, four, and seven days in an upright concrete silo containing 68,000 bu of in-shell peanuts.

Ferizli and Emekci (2000) applied \( \text{CO}_2 \) to treat dried figs in a gastight flexible storage unit loaded with 3.5 t of dried figs in perforated plastic boxes. Test insects were \( P. \) *interpunctella* (larvae), *O. surinamensis* (adults and eggs), and *Carposoglyphus lactis* (driedfruit mite, mixed stages). Results showed that oxygen concentrations in the containers decreased to 0.8% and carbon dioxide concentrations increased to 96%. For the following five days, both \( \text{O}_2 \) and \( \text{CO}_2 \) concentrations remained stable. Exposure of eggs and adults of *O. surinamensis*, larvae of *P. interpunctella*, and the mixed stages of *C. lactis* to environments containing high carbon dioxide (96–98%) resulted in complete mortality.

Prozell et al (1997) exposed cocoa beans, hazelnuts, and tobacco to a quick disinestation process by exposure to carbon dioxide under a pressure of 20–40 bar for a few hours. Experiments with caged pest insects (developmental stages and adults) of 12 species, (*L. serricorne, Oryzaephilus mercator, O. surinamensis, T. castaneum, T. confusum, Cryptolestes turcicus, Trogoderma granarium, Corcyra cephalonica, E. elutella, E. cautella, P. interpunctella, and Sitotroga cerealella*) were carried out on 1 t of bagged product in a 3-m³ chamber. At about 10°C, under 20 bar of \( \text{CO}_2 \), the lethal treatment period was slightly longer (3 hr) than at 20°C. At 20°C and 30 and 37 bar, complete control was achieved within 1 hr and within 20 min, respectively.

**Disinestation of Dates**

Dried fruits are subject to infestation by insect pests during and after harvest. Several species of nitidulid beetles are particularly associated with dried fruits because they are field and storage pests. Fumigation of dried fruits with MB upon arrival at the packing plant effectively controls infestation and also causes a high proportion of larvae and adults to emigrate from the fruit before they succumb (Navarro et al, 1989; Donahaye et al, 1991a).

The influence of different CAs in causing emigration of *Carphophilus* larvae from dates was compared with the effects of MB by Navarro et al (1989) and Donahaye et al (1991a). Recommended dosages for mortality of most stored-product pests using CA are >60% carbon dioxide for at least 11 days of exposure (Navarro and Donahaye, 1990). The influence of low-\( \text{O}_2 \) or high-\( \text{CO}_2 \) atmospheres as alternatives to fumigation of dried fruits has been investigated by Soderstrom and Brandl (1984), Soderstrom et al (1986), and Tarr et al (1994).

Laboratory experiments were carried out to investigate the influence of different MAs (20% carbon dioxide in air or 2.8% oxygen in nitrogen), low pressures alone, or MB alone in causing nitidulid beetles to emigrate from infested dried fruit, for which dates served as a model (Donahaye et al, 1992b; Navarro et al, 1998c). At 4 hr of exposure and 26°C, the treatments that had a marked influence in causing insects to abandon the infested fruit were low pressure of 100 mm of Hg and 2.8% oxygen in nitrogen, all of which caused more than 80% of the initial insect populations to emigrate from the fruit.

In another study (Navarro et al, 1989), 35% \( \text{CO}_2 \) was found to cause a similar emigration to \( \text{O}_2 \)-depleted or low-pressure atmospheres. This method is currently in use to cause emigration of insects from dates processed in several packing houses in Israel.

In addition, \( \text{CO}_2 \) atmospheres were studied for the long-term preservation of dates. The conventional date preservation after harvest in Israel is cold storage at –18°C. This is the most suitable method for soft-fruit sensitive cultivars, but it is energy-consuming. Very limited work has been done to determine the influence of CAs on date quality. Under laboratory conditions (Navarro et al, 2001b) and in field tests at ambient temperatures (Navarro et al, 1992, 1998b), carbon dioxide significantly delayed browning and sugar formation in dates and extended shelf life as compared to storage at –18°C.

A CA of 60–80% carbon dioxide was used within a 151-m³ plastic chamber partially filled with 30 t of dates stacked in crates on pallets (Navarro et al, 1998b). At the initial purge phase, the desired carbon dioxide concentration was obtained in the chamber within 1 hr by introducing the gas under high pressure. An intermittent maintenance phase was then applied for four to five months, using approximately 0.8 kg of carbon dioxide per day. At the end of storage, the quality of the treated dates was compared with that of controls stored at –18°C. No significant difference was found between the treated dates and the controls. The insect population was effectively controlled. This technology is proposed for the treatment of stored dried fruits to control pests and maintain quality.

**Packaging of Food**

Lang (1993) discussed the use of gases in the packaging of meat and fish, milk products, bakery products, fruits, vegetables, and nuts. The techniques involved include MA packaging (MAP), CA packaging (CAP), MA storage (MAS), and accelerated ripening. MAP, CAP, and MAS use combinations of \( \text{CO}_2 \), \( \text{O}_2 \), and \( \text{N}_2 \).
The effects of storage temperatures (8 and 36°C) and packaging atmospheres (air and N₂) on the quality of almonds were studied by Garcia-Pascual et al. (2003). The quality of unshelled almonds remained high after nine months, even under storage at ambient temperature. No significant differences were observed for any of the measured parameters in nuts stored in air or N₂.

A number of packaged foods are purged with nitrogen or carbon dioxide atmospheres to prevent microbial activity and insect development (New and Rees, 1988). Guidelines for using MAs in packaged food, with special emphasis on microbiological and nutritional aspects, were published by the Council of Europe (Anonymous, 1999a).

**Museum Artifacts**

Nontoxic approaches to insect control in museum collections to provide safety to both the artifact and the museum professional were described by Rust and Kennedy (1993). This volume explains the research done to demonstrate how inert-gas atmospheres can be used to eliminate insect infestation in museum objects and collections. The application of MA technology in museums and the pioneering research of conservation scientists is well documented by Selwitz and Maekawa (1998). Also, the possibilities of controlling pests in artifacts using inert gases are reported by Frank (1991), Reichmuth et al. (1991, 1993), Wudtke and Reichmuth (1994), and Sa-Fischer et al. (1997).

**Fresh Storage of Fruits and Vegetables**

Fresh fruits and vegetables may be shipped or stored in CAs. This topic is covered in depth by Calderon and Barkai-Golan (1990).

**Narcissus Bulb Treatments**

In experimental procedures, Navarro et al. (1997b) and Finkelman et al. (2002b) found extremely rapid depletion of O₂ within the sealed gastight enclosure where newly harvested narcissus bulbs were stored due to the respiration of the bulbs (Navarro et al., 2002c; Rindner et al., 2003). Under these hermetically sealed conditions, a rapid depletion of O₂ to 0.1% took place within 18 hr, while the CO₂ concentration increased to 21%. The temperatures in the chamber ranged from 28 to 30°C, and the humidity rose steadily from 60 to 84% RH, while it reached 100% under the top liner within 18 hr. Complete mortality of the larger narcissus bulb larvae was observed in all 13 treatments made during the 2003 export season (Navarro et al., 2003a).

**ECONOMICS OF TREATMENT**

**Cost of Sealing**

It is essential to thoroughly seal the enclosure to be treated before the use of an MA. Sealing of silo bins or the MA-treated enclosure is not only to retain the intended gas composition but also to physically exclude insects from sealed bins. This is an important method for incorporation into an integrated pest management strategy. Mann et al. (1997) reported a sealing method to retain and uniformly maintain CO₂ concentrations in welded-steel farm bins. The method is flexible and can be used for any bin opening.

Sealing techniques and costs are described in detail by Banks and Annis (1980), Newman (1990), Ripp (1984), and Ripp et al. (1990). Only pressure chambers are sufficiently gastight; new concrete silos and welded-steel silo bins may be converted to gastight structures with an investment marginal to that of the entire storage complex. Cracks in concrete structures can be sealed with polyurethane foam, silicone adhesives, or other materials. A flexible paint may significantly reduce diffusion through concrete walls. Windows and doors may be sealed with gastight plastic liners and adhesive tape (Ripp et al., 1990). PVC has limited permeability to oxygen and to carbon dioxide, depending on the thickness of the liner (Navarro and Zettler, 2001). The starch in paper glue has proven to be a reasonably low-cost and environmentally friendly sealant for fumigations, but it is not recommended for MA treatment—the losses through the sealing are extremely high. The paper does not resist the pressure differences exerted on it, and permeability is extremely high, which cause rapid losses.

Bag stacks or flat storages may be sealed under a layer of plastic sheeting. Different sheets can be attached by heat or adhesives. To avoid leaks, it is important to avoid folds where the foils overlap. On the floor, the covering sheets should overlap about 50 cm on each side, and they should be glued to the floor with silicone adhesive and held in place with wooden bars. The bars should be secured to the floor to ensure a gastight connection between the floor and the sheets. As an alternative, commercially available structures such as “GrainPro Cocoons” (described below) or “Volcani Cubes” offer a practical solution (Navarro et al., 2003a).

Jayas (2000) reported on a recently developed method to calculate leakage areas in imperfectly sealed bins from pressure-decay times obtained from pressure-decay tests. Using the predicted leakage area and the planned initial CO₂ concentration, the CO₂ concentration profile can be projected over time, and the required length of treatment and amounts of CO₂ to be added can be calculated. A new concept, the cumulative lethality index, was developed to predict the mortality of rusty grain beetles (Cryptolestes ferrugineus) in bins with declining CO₂ concentrations. These relationships were considered important tools for successful control of insects in stored grain using CO₂ in Canada (Jayas, 2000).

According to Adler et al. (2000), for a cost-effective treatment lasting four weeks, the daily rates of leakage from the treatment enclosure should not exceed 25% of the volume. This seems a very tolerant gastightness that causes rapid CO₂ loss. On the other hand, Navarro et al. (1993)
suggested a maximum infiltration rate for MAs as an increase of 0.5% O₂ per day.

In a study by Navarro and Zettler (2001) to test the infiltration rate of oxygen and carbon dioxide, a flexible empty structure of 7.5-m³ capacity was used to demonstrate the critical limits of the degree of sealing using the variable-pressure test. This flexible structure is marketed as the “GrainPro Cocoon” and is used for outdoor storage of stacked commodities. Time, in minutes, for half-life pressure decay was correlated with daily ventilation rates of O₂ and CO₂. The ventilation rates were tested using different sizes of cross-section leak areas, with orifices of 1.6, 3.2, and 6.4 mm i.d. To evaluate the influence of temperature on the rate of gas exchange, the cube was tested when it was shaded to minimize the direct solar heating effect and when it was exposed to direct solar heating. The oxygen infiltration rate for MAs was 0.5% O₂ per day at a 5-min half-life pressure decay when the chamber was in the shade. For the same level of gastightness, gas loss was 0.8% O₂ per day when the cube was exposed (Fig. 17). The CO₂ loss rate was 2% per day at a 5-min half-life pressure decay when the cube was under shade and 3% per day when exposed (Fig. 18).

These data allow careful calculation of the sealing level required for successful application of an MA. Sealing costs could be compared to expected gas losses using the above-suggested gastightness criteria for achieving insect control.

According to Adler et al (2000), a reasonable sealing of a granary for subsequent treatments with carbon dioxide or nitrogen may cost about US$4.50/t. A flour mill treatment with carbon dioxide applied in combination with heat (Corinth and Reichmuth, 1995) was estimated to cost anywhere from US$5–7.50/m³.

Cost of Gas

Several factors influence the cost of CO₂ or N₂ treatments. The largest of these are the costs of CO₂ or N₂, which are based on yearly usage, transportation costs, and competition among producers. Other costs include equipment rental (tank, vaporizer, etc.) and labor to apply the materials. Loss of gases through leaks, leading to the need to apply more gas to maintain the concentration, also contributes greatly to the cost. In Australia, where sealing is rigorously practiced before using MAs, an adequate treatment is considered to be 1 t of CO₂ per 1,000 t of wheat (Banks and Annis, 1980). At a cost of US$75/t for CO₂, this is equivalent to a treatment cost of less than US$0.076/t of wheat (Jay, 1984a). However, where sealing costs are high and CO₂ costs are low, as is the case in the United States, it may not be profitable to do extensive sealing of storage vessels before treatment.

There is an abundant supply of CO₂ in the United States. Carbon dioxide is a by-product of the production of ammonia, ethylene oxide, and alcohol and is also obtained from natural CO₂ wells. Nitrogen is generally produced by the energy-intensive process of separating it from the other components of air and is generally more expensive per unit than CO₂.

Jay (1980) estimated the cost of CO₂ to treat 28,000 bu (711 t) of corn in an upright concrete silo to be from US$0.75–1.33/t. However, this was based on a CO₂ cost of US$104–180/t. Recently, costs have been quoted as low as US$56/t, making the original estimates quite high. At US$56/t, those costs would range from US$0.36 to 0.42/t of corn for the CO₂ depending on the method of application.

Costs for CO₂ in the two previously described studies (Jay, 1980, 1984a) on wheat in the terminal elevators were estimated to be US$0.24–0.27/t of wheat, with the price for CO₂ at US$60/t. Treatment costs in the tests with milo and corn were estimated to be US$0.30 and 0.26/t of grain, respectively, for a 96-hr treatment. Most of these costs are slightly higher than (but compare favorably with) those quoted by one elevator for the fumigant “80-20” of US$0.21/t of grain (Jay, 1984a). For purposes of reference,
1995 chemical fumigation costs in the United States were cited as US$0.67/t of gain for large storage elevators (Hagstrum and Flinn, 1995).

The costs of MA treatment have been calculated for nitrogen and for carbon dioxide used in concrete silos in Berlin, Germany, where the gas is introduced slowly to the grain mass from the bottom, avoiding any turbulent flux (Adler et al, 2000). The initial costs were in the range of US$0.25/t for nitrogen and US$0.4/t for carbon dioxide. The costs for effective treatment may vary between US$1.5/t for moderately leaky structures to US$7.5/t for very leaky structures at a temperature of 15°C. At 20°C, the same costs range between US$1 and 3.8. These figures do not include the costs of sealing, which were provided by Love et al (1983) and Love (1984).

**CURRENT USAGE OF MA**

This section is an updated summary of the survey already published by Adler et al (2000).

**Australia**

Nitrogen treatment has been used commercially since 1992 for wheat, coarse grains, oilseeds, and pulses. A grain export terminal has integrated application of nitrogen for insect control before shipment into its procedures. A grain terminal in Newcastle treated about 262,678 t of grain with nitrogen between 1992 and 1999. In this terminal, the average usage of N₂ was about 1.5 m³/t. Use of carbon dioxide is limited to organic-grade cereals. The typical average usage of CO₂ is about 1 kg/t of wheat. The total application of CO₂ on cereal grains is less than 100 t per year.

**Bangladesh**

Hermetic storage is used for paddy and wheat seeds in projects supported by nongovernmental organizations (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Bostwana**

The Ministry of Interior uses hermetic storage for about 3,000 t of food security stocks, mainly sorghum and maize (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Cambodia**

About 400 t of paddy and paddy seed is stored under hermetic conditions by Australian-supported projects (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Canada**

Carbon dioxide is registered as an insecticide on grain, but nitrogen is not. Most carbon dioxide fumigations have been experimental. The only commercial use is at one terminal elevator in Vancouver, where 15 concrete silo bins of 1,100 t are regularly treated with carbon dioxide. A few organic farmers use this gas. Grain treated with carbon dioxide annually amounts to less than 10,000 t.

**China**

A few thousand tonnes of wheat was stored in hermetic silos in Shandung and Henan provinces (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Cyprus**

Until 1998, about 20,000 t of barley was stored under hermetic conditions. The hermetic structures were above-ground bunker-type storages covered with plastic liner and destined for long-term storage.

**France**

Nitrogen generators are used experimentally to treat grain bins and grain-handling machinery to avoid risks of dust explosions in silos. On a limited commercial level, commodities such as coffee, cocoa, fruits, pistachio nuts, spices, dehydrated plants, seeds for drug extraction, and high-value-added products are treated using nitrogen.

**Germany**

A total of 5,239 t of carbon dioxide and nitrogen was sold as insecticides and acaricides for plant protection of durable stored commodities in 1998 (Anonymous, 1999b). Carbon dioxide was registered in 1989 and nitrogen in 1990. Less than 5% of the grain, and other food products, is treated with carbon dioxide. Some companies use carbon dioxide in combination with phosphine for faster distribution in grain. Herbs, spices, drugs, teas, dried fruits, and some other valuable products are commercially treated with carbon dioxide at high pressures. Nitrogen is used in packaged food items, for disinfection of fruits, and to control pests of museum artifacts.

**Indonesia**

A few hundred tonnes of paddy seeds and paddy are stored under gastight conditions by the National Seed Company and some cooperatives in Java and Sumatra (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Israel**

The amount of grain in hermetic storage varies from about 20,000 to 60,000 t annually. Recently, on a semi-commercial basis, hermetic storage was used for 100 t of narcissus bulbs. Approximately 60 t per year of carbon dioxide is used for stored-product protection. This includes the use of the gas in combination with phosphine or MB for fumigation of approximately 30,000 t of grain. Additionally, about 4,000 t of dates (approximately 30% of the total) is treated with a mixture of MB and carbon dioxide. Another 300 t of dates is treated with carbon dioxide alone. A small quantity of organic wheat, seeds, herbs, and dates is treated with carbon dioxide.

**Italy**

About 5 t of carbon dioxide is used for treatment of stored grain. At present, the use of carbon dioxide does not require registration. Nitrogen is used for experimental purposes.

**Philippines**

The hermetic storage method is used by the National Food Authority for the preservation of paddy and milled rice. About 10,000 t of paddy and milled rice is stored using the commercially available “Volcani Cubes” or the “GrainPro Cocoons” for bagged stored grain. In addition, seeds of Philrice (the Philippines Rice Research Institute) are stored under hermetic conditions (about 200 t). Some
food and feed companies use hermetic storage to prevent infestation and moisture absorption. The International Rice Research Institute in Los Baños uses hermetic storage for seeds and paddy (an estimated 400 t) (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Rwanda**

The Ministry of Agriculture introduced hermetic storage for food security and seed stocks of maize and sorghum. A few thousand tonnes are stored in Kigali and some smaller amounts are scattered over the district (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Spain**

Carbon dioxide is used in packaged rice and dried fruits. High-pressure carbon dioxide is used by the spice and dry fruit industries for disinfestation purposes (Jordi Riudavets, IRTA, personal communication).

**Sri Lanka**

About 4,000 t of paddy is stored under hermetic conditions by the Ministry of Agriculture (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Thailand**

The Department of Agriculture has introduced hermetic storage for corn seeds, mung bean seeds, and paddy. It has introduced the use of CO₂ to the organic-rice sector (Tom deBruin, GrainPro, personal communication, 2004).

**Turkey**

Carbon dioxide is used on an experimental basis by the fig-processing companies as an alternative to MB fumigation. Also, a high-pressure carbon dioxide plant exists for the treatment of high-value commodities like spices and dried fruits.

**United Kingdom**

Carbon dioxide is used in mobile enclosures to control insect pests affecting museum artifacts. Carbon dioxide must be registered, and one company holds the label for the use of this gas. Nitrogen does not require registration, and its use may be limited to treating museum articles.

**United States**

Numerous MA studies were conducted by the largest cereal-grain processors using carbon dioxide, inert-atmosphere generators, pressure-swing adsorption systems, and gas-permeable-membrane systems. One company uses two inert-atmosphere generators for treatment of durum wheat. Carbon dioxide, nitrogen, and combustion-product gases are exempt from the requirement for a residue tolerance.

**RESEARCH NEEDS**

MA.s have been shown to be a viable alternative to residue-producing conventional fumigants for controlling insects that attack stored commodities. Although most of the data are related to insect response and related topics, quality preservation of durable agricultural products under MA remains an aspect of interest. The following research needs are considered in two general categories: laboratory research and field research.

**Laboratory Work**

Laboratory studies that concentrate on elucidating various aspects of the responses of storage insects and the influence of MA.s on treated commodities are still attracting the interest of researchers. In spite of numerous reports on the enhanced effectiveness of MA treatments at high-temperature and low-RH conditions, a contradicting report was submitted by Bell et al (2003) regarding the efficacy of heat in increasing the toxicity of carbon dioxide. Additional information that will contribute to clarifying this aspect of insect sensitivity is most relevant.

Most efficacy tests have been based on LT₉₅ or LT₉₉ values. To achieve Probit 9 (a criterion for insect treatments that defines 99.9968% mortality of the insect population), as required for quarantine, treatments could be based on extended exposure times, which would limit the application of MA.s. In this regard, additional research on diapausing insects in temperate climates would be required, to determine a different exposure-time schedule than that for sensitive species. For this purpose, collaboration among different laboratories should lead to the development of standardized experimental protocols.

In high-pressure CO₂ treatments, systematic studies need to be made on the relevance to pest mortality of product temperature, as well as the influence of exposure time and pressure-release time. Data on the processes leading to insect mortality in ambient-pressure and in high-pressure treatments are needed to improve treatment methods and reduce exposure times.

Under low pressures, some insects show increased resistance. It may be possible that some sort of physiological mechanism protects these insects, as probably happened in the experiments of Cline and Highland (1987), when Trogoderma variabile adults survived for 12 weeks at 48 mm of Hg and 27°C. To elucidate this aspect, more work on insect response to low-pressure treatments is necessary, as well as research on the effect of temperature on insect metabolism at low pressures. Data on the effect of low pressures on some economically important insect species like _P. interpunctella_ are not sufficiently documented in the literature. The accepted belief is that carbohydrate reserves in insects are utilized by the glycolytic pathway during anaerobic metabolism, but little information is available in the literature on lipid and carbohydrate metabolism under the stress of hypoxia and hypercarbia. These results add to the existing database, showing that low-pressure treatments can provide an effective alternative to fumigation within the framework of practical exposure times and commercially feasible equipment.

The review of Banks (1981) reveals that most studies on the effects of MA.s have been done by testing grain quality. He concludes that for low-moisture-content grains, low O₂, and high CO₂ concentrations do not have a detrimental effect on the germination, milling, and baking properties of wheat or the organoleptic properties of rice, although for intermediate- and high-moisture-content grains, the quality is affected. Studies on long-term hermetic storage of wheat (Navarro et al, 1984, 1993) also clearly indicate that both the germination and baking properties of wheat are well preserved and the milling properties of dry paddy are not...
affected (Donahaye et al, 1991b). Detailed studies on the quality preservation of commodities sensitive to oxidation and on retention of aromatic components, as in the case of spices and beverages, remain to be made. Preliminary work on preservation of the organoleptic qualities of spices like chili pepper, coriander seeds, turmeric rhizomes, and cumin seeds showed excellent preservation under vacuum and better preservation under hermetic or carbon dioxide atmospheres than under exposure to normal chamber atmosphere (Navarro et al, 2001a, 2002b). Similar work to determine the beneficial effects of MA treatment on the quality of treated products is needed.

### Field Work

#### Temperature and Humidity

Alterations in the temperature of large grain bulks to enhance the effectiveness of MA treatments are seldom carried out. Data on the use of heated air to increase the temperature of the commodity before MA treatment to modify the temperature of the commodity or of the MA-treated space would contribute to our knowledge. Similarly, the humidity of the interstitial space is dictated by the moisture content of the grain. Since it is a part of the system, it is difficult to modify. Additional information related to the control of humidity to enhance MA treatment is needed.

During high-CO₂ treatment, sorption of CO₂ causes significant reduction in the gas concentration. These changes must be taken into account when deciding on the required exposure time. Except in very tightly sealed small metal chambers, additional gas introductions are likely to be required, based on concentration readings taken during the exposure. To avoid structural damage due to daily temperature fluctuations, particularly in the headspace of metal structures, appropriate pressure-relief valves must be installed. Even in the best-sealed structures, a reduction in CO₂ concentration or increase in O₂ concentration occurs over time due to gas loss through pressure-relief valves or leaks in the structure.

MA treatments are not considered practical for treatment of mills, processing plants, or any other structures that are difficult to seal tightly.

If the investment costs for membrane or pressure-swing absorption units are markedly reduced, some durable products may even be stored continuously under MAs, to control pests and maintain product quality. Moreover, material protection and disinfection of artifacts will most probably be carried out more widely by the use of humidified nitrogen. At least in museums, treatment time is seldom a problem.

#### Vacuum Technology

In the application of vacuum technology, fairly low pressures are required to obtain insect kill within reasonable periods. Additional systematic studies on insect response to low-pressure treatment are required. A process, named vacuum hermetic fumigation, was recently proposed that uses flexible liners to achieve low pressures in transportable structures. Low pressures (25–50 mm of Hg), can be attained and maintained for indefinite periods of time (Finkelman et al, 2002a, 2003a).

Special portable chambers made of flexible tarplike sheeting provide the benefit of treatment in any location where sufficient quantities of CO₂ or N₂ are available. These chambers enable low-cost treatment, utilizing nonrigid low-permeability envelopes. Use of these materials for museum artifacts seems to be most suitable.

#### High-Pressure Carbon Dioxide

CO₂ treatments can be significantly shortened to exposure times that may be measured in hours by applying increased pressure (10–37 bar) in specially designed metal chambers that can withstand these high pressures. Such high-pressure chamber treatments may be practical for high-value products, such as spices, nuts, dried fruits, medicinal herbs, and other special commodities.

If pressurized carbon dioxide is recycled in a double chamber, the moisture content of the gas may influence its efficacy.

#### Hermetic Storage

A type of MA that can be applied for the protection of grain is hermetic storage, also termed “sealed storage,” “airtight storage,” or “sacrificial sealed storage.” In sufficiently sealed structures, insects and other aerobic organisms in the grain mass reduce the O₂ and increase the CO₂ concentrations through respiratory metabolism, to levels below those permitting insect development. Hermetic long-term storage, as used in Cyprus, Israel, and the Philippines, seems a feasible technique. More field data on the application of this technique would contribute to our knowledge.

#### Degree of Sealing

Sealing methodologies have been well developed and published (Alexander, 1984; Lloyd, 1984; Sutherland and Thomas, 1984; Woodcock, 1984; Newman, 1990). However, in practice, sealing of rigid structures has been limited mainly to Australia, and elsewhere many new silos are being built to low standards of sealing that do not permit application of hermetic storage or MA treatments. Gas-tightness and temperature insulation factors are often underestimated and neglected when new storage facilities are constructed.

The future approach to silo construction should take a more professional attitude toward silo sealing. It should acknowledge that a high level of sealing is essential in the modern approach to fumigation, to reduce emissions (especially of MB because of its association with ozone depletion) and also to eliminate the possibility of development of phosphine-resistant insect populations. New environmental and food-quality regulations may force pest managers and fumigators to improve gastightness and to reduce the emission of toxic chemicals. These developments will improve not only the treatments with toxic fumigants but also the commercial competitiveness of MAs in the protection of stored products.

#### Headspace

A major problem in rigid structures is the volume of headspace above the grain bulk. This is not only a limiting factor in determining the rate at which O₂ concentration decreases, but it also accentuates pressure differences...
between the interior and exterior of the silo due to daily temperature and barometric fluctuations of the ambient atmosphere. Pressure-relief valves provide a satisfactory solution for MA storage. However, the use of breather-bags to unify internal and external pressures appears to be more desirable for hermetic storage since this system reduces the gas exchange. To the best of our knowledge, breather-bags have not been employed in silo bins, except for “Harvestores” used for silage. Experimental data on the use of such breather-bags under tropical and subtropical climates would be very useful when considering the application of hermetic storage to reduce the intensity of air ingress into the storage system.

Moisture Condensation

A phenomenon that discourages the use of hermetic storage in hot climates is moisture migration and condensation, which is especially intensified in metal silos. In conventional storages, engineers rely on designing well-ventilated headspaces to reduce the intensity of this phenomenon, and they even incorporate aeration systems with excessively high airflow rates, regardless of their efficacy in the tropics. In subtropical climates with a cool season, aeration systems were shown to effectively overcome this problem by equalizing grain temperatures (Navarro and Noyes, 2002). For this reason, Navarro and Calderon (1980) proposed the integration of aeration when MAs are used in metal structures. However, the efficacy of this approach was never adequately documented.

For metal silos in hot climates, moisture condensation is intensified when insect infestation causes grain heating. The most disturbing effect of moisture migration, especially in rigid constructions, is the difficulty in removing the damaged layer, usually at the top of the bulk.

So far, two approaches are known to reduce the intensity of this phenomenon: equalizing grain temperatures and insulation of the roof. Equalizing grain temperatures by aeration is limited to climates with a cool season. Comparative data is lacking on the efficacy of aeration and the effect of insulation in preventing moisture migration in metal silos in the tropics.

For small-scale applications using flexible liners, the influence of insulation materials in reducing the intensity of moisture migration in subtropical (Israel) and tropical (Philippines) climates has been investigated by Donahaye et al. (2000). A model describing moisture migration by natural convection has been proposed (Nguyen, 1986). However, more experimental data are required to support the development of predictive models for hermetic storage.

Flexible Liners

One approach to hermetic storage has been through the use of flexible liners. All liners have the advantage that they follow the contours of the grain-bulk surface, and with no headspace, gas exchange is restricted to the intergranular air volume. However, there is still need for improvement in liner materials. Although liners with zero permeability to gases are available, other factors such as physical characteristics, durability, resistance to penetration by pests (rodents and insects), amenability to jointing and welding, and cost of manufacture are all critical to the choice of liner. Integration of all these characteristics into a single liner is still an objective of the future.

Acknowledgments

I wish to dedicate this chapter to Ed Jay, who pioneered the application of the MA technology in the United States and worldwide. I thank Ramon Albajes of the University of Lleida; Rosa Gabarra and Jordi Riudavets of the Department of Plant Protection of IRTA, Centre de Cabrils, Barcelona, Spain, for inviting me for a sabbatical year; and the Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport of Spain for providing the support (reference number SAB2002-0016) that enabled the collaboration during the preparation of this chapter.

References Cited

Ali Niazee, M. T. 1972. Susceptibility of the confused and red flour beetles to anoxia produced by helium and nitrogen in various temperatures. J. Econ. Entomol. 65:60.


Donahaye, E. 1990b. Laboratory selection of resistance by the red flour beetle Tribolium castaneum (Herbst) to a carbon dioxide-enriched atmosphere. Phytoparasitica 18:299-308.


Federal Register. 1980. Tolerances and exemptions from tolerances for pesticides chemicals in or on raw agricultural commodities; carbon dioxide, nitrogen, and combustion product gas. 45(223):75663-75664.

Federal Register. 1981. Carbon dioxide, nitrogen, and combustion product gas; tolerances for pesticides in food administered by the Environmental Protection Agency. 46(122):32865-32866.


Finkelman, S., Navarro, S., Rindner, M., Dias, R., and Azrieli, A. 2005. Effect of low pressures on the survival of Trogoderma granarium (Everts), Lasioderma serricorne (F.), and Oryzaephilus surinamensis (L.) at 30°C. J. Stored Prod. Res. (in press.)


Fleurat-Lessard, F., and Le Torc’h, J. M. 1987. Practical approach to purging grain with low-oxygen atmosphere for disinfestation of large wheat bins against the granary weevil, Sitophilus granarius. In: Proc. 4th Int. Work. Conf. on Stored-Product...


